

A Comparative Study of Strategy Development Model Halal Tourism for Economic Growth in the Islamic Tourism Industry Sector Indonesia and Malaysia

Tulus Suryanto¹, Yeni Susanti² and Weni Rosilawati³

Abstract

This research investigates the development model of the halal tourism strategy in Indonesia and Malaysia. The aim is to reveal how the growth of the tourism sector in ASEAN countries. The research locations for this comparative study were Lombok Island, Indonesia as well as the island of Terengganu, Malaysia. Qualitative research methods guide researchers to answer the formulation of the problem. From the results of data analysis, halal tourism conditions on Lombok Island are supported by geographical location. However, the condition of facilities, accommodation, and business support still need to be addressed. Halal tourism conditions on Terengganu Island are supported by qualified facilities, accommodation, and government regulatory support. The comparative study shows that halal tourism on Lombok Island and Terengganu Island has differences from the condition of business actors. There is still low awareness of restaurant owners to make halal certification on Lombok Island. The similarity in policy is strong institutional support. The conclusion is that economic growth through halal tourism in Indonesia and Malaysia is highly dependent on strengthening the strategies carried out. That is by implementing Pentabelix collaboration that focuses on geographical potential, facilities, accommodation, supporting infrastructure and government policies.

Keywords: *Economic Growth, Tourism Industry, Halal Tourism.*

INTRODUCTION

The halal tourism industry is recovering and growing rapidly after the Covid-19 pandemic. This Islamic tourism trend is driven by the increasing number of foreign Muslim tourists. Islamic tourism is generally less well-known than other types of tourism and is frequently referred to as halal tourism, Muslim tourism, Muslim-friendly tourism, or Sharia tourism. But an array of nations, including Thailand, the Philippines, Singapore, Korea, Japan, Taiwan, and China, have started to cultivate this tourism. Halal tourism is becoming a growing trend among tourists from around the world. It is anticipated that travelers' outbound tourism sector will generate US\$243 billion in revenue in 2021 (Rehman, 2022). As reported by Thomson Reuters and DinarStandard's World Islamic Economy report, the Muslim travel industry reached \$140 billion in 2013 or 11.5% of worldwide spending. The potential signal is anticipated to grow in 2019 to US\$ 238 billion, or almost 13% of global tourism industry spending. One of the markets with the quickest expansion is the Muslim one. Islamic financial assets are anticipated to boost the global Isla economy market by around US\$3.6 trillion by 2022 and US\$4.9 trillion by 2025 (Shafaki, 2022).

In 2019, 160 million tourists from Muslim countries visited. The expansion of worldwide travel has helped raise the number of Muslim tourists, who are expected to reach 160 million by 2024. Pre-pandemic projections of Muslim tourist arrivals of around 230 million will be realized in 2028 with an estimated expenditure and spending from Muslim tourists of US\$ 225 billion (Juliana et al., 2023). As noted by Nurrachmi (2019), Middle Eastern visitors are known for being high-spending customers who prefer to spend their vacations in similar cultural settings. As a result, this circumstance provides a tremendous catalyst and chance for ASEAN nations to draw both Muslim and non-Muslim tourists to Southeast Asian nations. We can see from this estimate that there is a sizable market for Muslim visitors around the world. Therefore, it merits the utmost care that has an effect on raising sales in the tourism sector.

¹ Faculty of Islamic Economic and Business, Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Intan Lampung, Email: tulus@radenintan.ac.id, (Corresponding Author)

² Faculty of Islamic Economic and Business, Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Intan Lampung, Email: yenisusanti@radenintan.ac.id

³ Faculty of Islamic Economic and Business, Universitas Islam Negeri Raden Intan Lampung, Email: wenyrosilawati@radenintan.ac.id

Southeast Asian nations, including Indonesia and Malaysia, are home to the majority of the world's Muslims, who have converted to Islam and made it their primary religion. These nations are rich in natural resources, civilization's past, sociocultural activities, and a variety of cuisines (Abror et al., 2020). Given the worldwide halal business trend, Southeast Asian nations have a lot of opportunity to grow their Muslim-friendly tourism sectors and strengthen their economies (Wahyono & Razak, 2020).

Halal tourism experiences 6% quicker growth than other tourism subsectors on average. It has been estimated that 108 million Muslim travelers worldwide contributed US\$145 billion to the tourism industry. It is predicted that 150 million Muslims will travel abroad by the year 2020 (Kemenparekraf, 2021). Malaysia is actively promoting its halal tourism industry. Similarly, Indonesia is also promoting Lombok as a popular destination for the tourism industry. Malaysia itself as a pioneer country of halal tourism has succeeded in maximizing the potential of the world's Muslim tourist market. Until it occupies the first position in The Global Travel Index (GMTI) 2022. The researcher identified that there are still very few studies from reputable international journals that conduct comparative studies investigating the development of halal tourism, especially on Lombok Island and Terengganu Island. Previous studies have investigated the potential of halal tourism in both countries. However, it has not deeply investigated the conditions of economic growth in the tourism industry and the development strategies carried out after the Covid-19 pandemi (Peristiwo, 2020). Bibliometric analysis has been conducted to study the structure of the halal tourism industry but was limited to the years 1975 to 2019 (Yagmur et al., 2020). Thus the novelty of research is shown by increasing comprehensive studies and insights to produce new findings about halal tourism from pre-existing studies.

The author will compare halal tourism in Indonesia and Malaysia, which have the largest Muslim populations in Asia. The initial observation shows that cultural diversity and geographical similarities make Indonesia and Malaysia quite competitive in various fields, especially tourism. Although Malaysia is a pioneer country in terms of halal tourism and has at least 5 iconic halal tourism cities. They are Kuala Lumpur, Putra Jaya, Langkawi, Kelantan, and Terengganu. However, Indonesia does not lose the competition through the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy (Kemenparekraf) for 3 provinces in Indonesia as halal tourist destinations, namely Aceh, Padang City, and West Nusa Tenggara. While 9 other provinces are targeted to develop halal tourism such as Riau, Lampung, Banten, Jakarta, West Java, Central Java, East Java, Yogyakarta, and South Sulawesi.

The purpose of this research project is to compare the halal tourism policies of Malaysia and Indonesia. The likelihood that this research will propose that stakeholders support the halal tourist development strategy is growing significantly. The results on the state of the tourism industry's economic growth are anticipated to be a study of halal tourism development strategies in nations with a majority of Muslims. The study's problem was then stated as: How is the model of halal tourism development strategy expected to affect the growth of the economy in the tourism industry and provide information for the study of halal tourism development models in Muslim-majority nations?.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Al-Hamarneh and Steiner (2004) claim that halal tourism, or, in its current form, targeting Muslim-friendly tourism providers, includes three concepts, economic concepts, cultural concepts, and conservative religious notions. The economic theory is centered on the emergence of new tourism sites and markets. Major tourism actors view Muslim-majority nations as one of the developing tourist destinations with enormous fiscal, social, and travel value. Visions and ideas that emphasize the use of Islamic cultural and religious sites in tourism programs with "pedagogical" and establishing trust elements are part of the cultural notion of Islamic tourism. It aims to promote a shift in tourism attractions away from hedonistic and "Western cultural" places and towards more historical, religious, and cultural sites associated with Islam. A conservative perspective and interpretation of Islam serves as the foundation for the idea of a religious conservative. The highly conservative aspects of the Islamic way of life with the modern travel and tourist sector may in fact offer new tourism opportunities, habitats, and venues.

By Chookaew et al. (2015), halal tourism development criteria in terms of administration and management include: (1) Facilities to tourists must adhere to general Muslim principles; (2) Tour guides and personnel must maintain discipline and respect sharia law; (3) Control all operations so that they do not conflict with sharia

law; (4) Constructions must adhere to sharia law; (5) Restaurants must adhere to international standards of halal services; and; (7) There are locations set aside for all Muslim tourists to engage in religious activities; (8) Traveling to locations that do not contravene the tenets of Islam; and (9) Transportation services must have a security protection system. There exists literature examining the growth of halal tourism in nations with a majority of Muslims. For example, Takeshita (2020) conducted a comparative study on halal tourism development strategies in Indonesia, Malaysia, and Singapore. His findings reveal that Singapore is a non-Organization of Islamic Cooperation country that is able to align itself well with Indonesia and Malaysia. The Mujahidin (2020) findings resulted in two dimensions that helped develop halal tourism, namely Muslim-friendly products and services. There is an association between interest and impressions of the intention to remain at a Halal hotel, according to Nurazizah and Rahmafitria (2021). Another study discovered cooperation and coordination amongst ASEAN nations in promoting halal tourism to increase state income benefits (Nurrachmi, 2019).

Empirical evidence shows a variety of challenges to the development of this tourism, including limited exploration, infrastructure issues, and lack of promotion of their own domestic resources (Satria et al., 2022; Jaelani, 2017; Mohezar et al., 2017). Previous studies in the last three-year period reveal the scope of halal tourism studies using sentiment studies of multilingual tweets where Japan, Malaysia, and Indonesia are the most tweeted (Ainin et al., 2020), paradigm for halal tourism growth in Malaysia and Indonesia (Wibawa et al., 2023), and factors influencing halal tourism visits (Lestari et al., 2023; Purwandani & Yusuf, 2021; Afniarius et al., 2020).

METHODOLOGY

This study examines the growth of halal tourism in Indonesia and Malaysia using a qualitative method approach. Quantitative approach with characteristics using deductive thinking (rational empirical or top-down) with the logic of positivism. Qualitative research is conducted through direct observation with a form of unstructured observation where researchers must have sensitivity and be able to develop their observational power, and the information collected is dynamic. While the documentation and interviews conducted are semi-structured interviews where the interviewer has prepared several types of questions for informants. However, the submission of these questions is flexible, depending on the direction of the conversation in drawing conclusions on the object of research sourced from field data on the best Islamic Tourism destinations in Indonesia and Malaysia. Additionally, this study uses descriptive and analytical methods to gather comprehensive data that is meaningful and has the potential to have a big impact on the study's main idea (Sugiyono, 2016). The nature of the link between researchers and participants, or between objects and study topics, is thus directly presented by this method. This approach likewise aims to examine the study topic in order to gather comprehensive data. A comparative study was conducted to investigate the extent of the conditions of excellence and constraints in the tourism sector in the two countries. The research locations are Lombok Island, West Nusa Tenggara, Indonesia and Terengganu Island, Kuala Terengganu, Malaysia.

Primary data collected directly from experts in the subject serve as the main data source. Visits to Muslim-friendly tourist attractions in Indonesia (on Lombok Island) and Malaysia (on Terengganu Island) provided the primary data for this study. In the form of books, articles, journals, reports, conference papers, and pertinent web pieces, secondary data is information used to support research. Data analysis is the method of analysis used by Miles et al. (2013). The method of data analysis consists of three parts. Data reduction is accomplished by choosing, concentrating on simplification, abstracting from, and manipulating raw data. The data are then reduced in the second stage by being summarized, coded, tracked for themes, and clustered. The arrangement of the data presentation to allow for inference and subsequent action is the last step. Following data collection, information is systematically processed in accordance with how the problem was formulated.

RESULT AND DISCUSSIONS

The findings reveal that the growth conditions of the halal tourism industry on the two islands are very much different. Halal tourism conditions on Lombok Island still lack infrastructure and community support. In

contrast to Terengganu Island, which is able to provide quite capable facilities and support from its people regarding halal certification. Currently, the direction of tourism development focuses on Muslim-friendly facilities ranging from accessibility, services, types of activities, to halal food processing and serving. The goal is to provide comfort and tranquility for Muslim tourists while on vacation. Lombok Island has very varied halal tourism attractions, ranging from nature, culture, culinary, fashion, and artificial. Learning from halal tourism on Terengganu Island, Malaysia, specially packaged event packages are enough to attract tourists to come and extend their visit schedule on Terengganu Island.

Island of Lombok, Indonesia

Observations show that the condition of economic growth on Lombok Island has decreased every year. The poor population of West Lombok reached 17% with an unemployed labor force level of 3.35%. The minimum wage is still very low and the distribution of infrastructure development has not been evenly distributed in all regions. Currently, the agricultural sectors that rely on natural resources are the backbone of development with a contribution to Gross Regional Domestic Revenue of 20.23%. Therefore, the local government has begun to seriously develop the prospect of a potential tourism industry. Tourism potential is supported by geographical characteristics with a cluster of small islands (Gili), tropical climate, and Sasak Tribe culture. But on the other hand, the community has not fully contributed to the core tourism activities either as a tour guide, souvenir producer, or travel agency. The results of the interviews revealed that there has been a development gap between the southern and northern regions as seen from the distribution and number of facilities.

The maintenance of supporting facilities and facilities available for halal tourism is still limited and minimal in some areas. Mekaki Beach Tourism has no electricity network available which can hamper the availability of health facilities and banking facilities that require electricity supply. Gili tourism still utilizes fresh water from the surrounding villages. As a result, places of worship have limited water supply. Another problem was related to the garbage that had accumulated and had not been managed properly, causing environmental pollution. Tourism marketing and promotion activities are still partial and not maximized.”

Data 1 indicates that Lombok Island's halal tourism situation is not appropriately qualified. Local governments have a number of challenges in regard to infrastructure. The National Tourism Development Master Plan (RIPPNAS) 2010-2025, the Regional Tourism Master Plan (RIPPDA) of West Nusa Tenggara Province 2013-2028, and the Regional Regulation of West Nusa Tenggara Province Number 2 of 2016 have all been created by the government to support the growth of tourism. And the most recent is West Lombok Regency Number 1 of 2017 Regional Regulation Concerning the Implementation of Halal Tourism. The interview findings also revealed that Lombok Island, which has been developing for five years, was given a score of 70 by the 2019 Indonesia Muslim Travel Index (IMTI), placing it first among the top five travel destinations. Technical assistance and workshops are the tactics used by the central government in cooperation with local administrations.

The Ministry of Tourism and HalTrip provides a guidebook for Muslim visitors that makes it easy for Muslim tourists to find out recommendations for halal tourist attractions and sharia hotels with Muslim-friendly concepts available. The main objective is to encourage the accelerated development of global standard halal tourist destinations. Then, by emphasizing halal food and beverage services, worship facilities, clean restrooms and the availability of clean water, free of islamophobia, Ramadan programs, the provision of family-friendly recreation areas, and free of non-halal activities, the concept of halal tourism development is carried out with the theme of Muslim-friendly tourism. In the future, smart tourism will be a part of the halal tourism concept. Several halal tourist sites in Indonesia have pioneered this smart tourism concept. It has been effective in promoting halal tourism and assisting Muslim visitors in obtaining the information they require (Afnarius et al., 2020; Basrowi et al., 2020). The government is hoping that the halal tourist industry may grow on Lombok Island with the help of the smart tourism concept.

The transportation system on Lombok Island is supported by the provision of infrastructure through road and bridge construction programs to improve accessibility to and from tourist attraction locations. Based on the author's observations and interviews with the Tourism Office, one of the obstacles to tourism development in Lombok is the weak infrastructure. Access to and from tourist attraction locations has fairly difficult terrain,

some of which cannot even be reached by four-wheeled vehicles. Even if it can be reached by vehicle, it takes a long time because of the difficult terrain that must be traveled. There are even some tourist attraction locations that cannot be reached by road but must be reached by motorboat. The availability of supporting facilities for halal tourism in Lombok is generally still centered in the capital city of East Nusa Tenggara province. The lack of infrastructure is feared to have an impact on the interest of tourist visits to Lombok Island. Wahyudin et al. (2022) and Suryanto et al. (2022) mengungkapkan bahwa standardisasi fasilitas dan akomodasi sangat penting untuk meningkatkan kepercayaan stakeholder dalam mendukung konsep wisata halal.

The constraints of halal accommodation in Lombok are also related to the separation of toilets with places of ablution in each hotel guest room and the separation of male and female swimming pools. In addition, the low awareness of restaurant owners to make halal certification is also a challenge to developing halal tourism. The restaurant is lazy to take care of the halal certification of the Indonesian Ulema Council because they feel that all the food available in their restaurant/dining house is halal because they are Muslims. Halal certification for food and beverages aimed at Muslim tourists is very important to build trust in halal tourism products that carry Muslim-friendly services (Muhamed et al., 2019). Some foreign tourists have strict standards for halal certification of food and beverage products.

The majority of Lombok's population belongs to the Muslim faith, making it known as the island of a thousand mosques. Lombok Island has a unique culture and religious tradition and is supported by extraordinary natural beauty. One of the magnificent mosques is the Hubbul Wathan Mosque Islamic Center West Nusa Tenggara and Islamic Center Mataram. Even the mosque has been designated by the local government as an icon of Muslim religious tourism. Natural tourism is presented in the form of beaches, lakes, hills, Gili, waterfalls, and tourist parks. For example, Kuta Mandalika Beach, Pink Beach Lombok, Selong Belanak Beach, Merese Hill, Malimbu Hill, Tiu Kelep Waterfall, and Sesaot Tourism Park. Visitors to the beach are generally not charged an entrance ticket, only a very affordable vehicle parking fee ranging from IDR 2,000 to IDR 10,000. The famous cultural tourism is Pura Meru which was built in 1720 and is the largest temple on Lombok Island. In practice, most of the tours on Lombok Island can be visited by tourists without being charged an entrance fee and only need to pay a vehicle parking fee. This is one of the attractions for Muslim tourists who want to enjoy religious tourism without having to pay a large visit fee.

The research shows that Lombok Island already has a Regional Regulation related to halal tourism. However, in practice, weaknesses were identified in terms of funding. In addition, the concentration of the budget given to the provision of infrastructure has weakened since 2019 or precisely since the Covid-19 pandemic. On the other hand, currently Lombok Island has developed sports tourism (Mandalika Resing). However, the development carried out by the government should be supported by indicators that strengthen the halal tourism industry for the better. But reality actually weakens. The weakness is in the understanding or literacy of halal tourism in the community and parties who still do not understand the economic development strategy of the halal tourism industry. It is very important to involve universities in the region to be involved in research. So that it can support local government programs. For example, in Mataram there is the Faculty of Economics and Islamic Business (FEBI) of the State Islamic University (UIN) Mataram which has a Sharia tourism department; there is the Mataram College of Tourism (STP), and the Mataram Tourism Technology University. These universities must be involved to produce halal tourism industry agents in increasing halal tourism literacy.

Island of Terengganu, Malaysia

The state of economic growth in Terengganu is growing. This is indicated by an increase of about 5.9% with a value of RM 37.3 billion. Supporting sectors are *borong* and *runcit* trade, lodging, food, and beverages. The kingdom's serious attention is also on the agriculture sector and the promising halal tourism sector. A modern agriculture sector has been developed by the government. The capacity of the rivers in the potential area has also been utilized as well as possible. Economically, the people of Terengganu island have benefited a lot, especially from new jobs. For example, boat drivers, travel agency employees, and security guards.

Muslim-friendly halal tourism is an important part of the economic growth strategy. However, natural resources in some areas of Terengganu Island such as Kenyir Lake are still not maximally managed by halal

tourism players. The problem of poverty and low income of local communities is a challenge for the regional government. Strategic efforts to improve welfare are carried out by developing spiritual programs, infrastructure, and supporting facilities.”

Data 2 shows an overview of the economic conditions in Terengganu. Poverty is a major challenge in developing halal tourism in this region. Government efforts to improve welfare are quite good. This is indicated by the existence of various programs that have been carried out. Terengganu Island has a large mosque, namely the Tengku Tengah Zaharah Mosque, and the Krital Mosque floating on the Terengganu River which has a beautiful panorama. These mosques are one of the icons of Malaysia Halal Tour. The entrance ticket to the rides is RM 22 for adults, while children under 7 years old are still free. Some of the natural attractions are Pandak Beach, Duyong Island, Lang Tengah Island, Chemerong Waterfall, Kluang Hill, Kraf Terengganu Cultural Center, and Tanjung Jara Beach.

Some Muslim-friendly tourist attractions on the island of Terengganu are accessible with the availability of adequate infrastructure and amenities. To visit the hill, visitors can even take an escalator. Lombok Island and Terengganu Island also have supporting facilities and amenities. For example, money changers, tourist buses, and star hotels, tourist information centers. But for places of worship, not all tourist attractions have adequate facilities, especially in the hills and waterfalls. It's just not evenly distributed throughout Lombok, while in Terengganu this facility is available spread and evenly distributed in all areas of Terengganu. Accommodation in the form of hotels and homestays that support halal tourism in Terengganu is quite a lot and good, as evidenced by the number of Syariah hotels and homestays, as well as halal-certified restaurants and souvenir shops. Previous literature has explained that the Malaysian government has strictly implemented halal certification laws. So that business actors take care of halal certification for food and beverages that they aim for the Muslim community (Shirin Asa, 2019). The Malaysian government continues to increase the promotion of halal tourism. The government has a halal agency called Jabatan Kemajuan Islam Malaysia (JAKIM) and requires tourist attractions and Muslim-friendly restaurants to have halal certification. The concept of developing halal tourism is halal food and beverage services, clean toilets, available ablutions and places of worship, and free of non-halal activities. In addition, there are some special halal tourism areas that do not mix men and women. Thus, halal accommodation for tourists is more guaranteed because halal standards are almost all certified.

The overall results also show that strong institutional support, notably from the government, is a benefit of growing halal tourism in Lombok and Terengganu. Dispar Lombok is still conducting many workshops, social events, and training activities. The local government's commitment to managing halal tourism through proper legislation will have an effect on enhancing the welfare of the neighborhood through advancement in the economy. The growth of the creative economy in tourist destinations, the improvement of infrastructure in tourist areas where Malaysia is more advanced in terms of infrastructure, especially tourist destination areas, are all factors that contribute to regional original revenue (PAD), gross regional domestic product (GRDP), state foreign exchange, and national income. so that it can earn GMTI's award for the greatest halal destination in the world for eight straight years.

The existence of a halal tourism development strategy that has been carried out has an impact on the economic growth of the tourism sector. Development is carried out on halal tourism products, human resources, promotion, and preservation of existing tourism. Previous studies explain that halal tourism on Terengganu Island needs to improve the development direction of the availability of tourism agents and Muslim-friendly tourism service providers (Abi et al., 2012). Another study investigated economic growth in Terengganu. Its findings explain that the issue of community development of tourist villages is a serious challenge for the government (Ab Manaf et al., 2023). This study reveals its novelty by examining the development of strategies carried out by local governments. So the solution needs to be a model of halal tourism development strategy with the Pentahelix model. The Pentahelix model in question is to build economic growth through the halal tourism industry with the joint involvement of the government, education/higher education academics, the tourism industry, MSMEs as business institutions, and the community and the media. Previous studies have revealed that the Pentahelix principle is in line with the value of mutual cooperation that Indonesia has upheld since long ago. Collaboration of Pentahelix elements has also been carried out in disaster risk reduction efforts, MSME management performance, and food security (Syamsunasir et al., 2023; Subagyo et al., 2022; Yasir et al.,

2021). Research using the pentahelic approach in the tourism industry is limited to analyzing the impact of the pandemic and the development of natural and non-natural disaster mitigation models (Andreastuti et al., 2023; Syamsuadi et al., 2022; Purnomo et al., 2021). The end result is focused on efforts to determine the direction and long-term sustainability of halal tourism. The reason is that halal tourism is an important asset to improve the welfare of society. Therefore, it can be understood that the governments in both countries are quite successful in building a legal framework for halal tourism. It's just that in practice, it still needs to improve infrastructure, communicate, and raise awareness of the importance of halal tourism development.

CONCLUSION

The findings have revealed the development model of halal tourism strategy in two ASEAN countries. The economic growth condition of the tourism sector in Lombok Island, West Nusa Tenggara, Indonesia is quite good. There are various kinds of Muslim-friendly halal tourist attractions and supporting facilities. It's just that this infrastructure is not evenly available throughout halal tourism on Lombok Island. The condition of economic growth in the tourism sector on the island of Terengganu, Malaysia is also quite good. This is supported by a variety of halal tourism attractions, especially religious tourism. Based on the findings, it can be concluded that as an archipelago, Indonesia has the advantage of halal tourism in terms of potential attractions that are very varied, ranging from nature, culture, culinary, fashion, and artificial. While Malaysia has the advantage of halal tourism in terms of accessibility and accommodation to tourist attractions. The novelty of this research is shown by the scientific contribution to the development of the tourism industry based on the dimensions of regional potential, accessibility, accommodation, supporting and supporting facilities, and the role of government. This research has limitations in terms of the area investigated and the methodology used. Future research can expand the research area of halal tourism with a more sophisticated methodology. Both countries basically have the advantages and extraordinary potential of halal tourism. It's just that in terms of future development still requires more support and cooperation between the government, the private sector, and the community. The expected implication is that the government provides a special budget and policy to increase the growth of the potential halal tourism sector in the region.

REFERENCES

- Ab Manaf, N., Sa'at, N. H., A Rahim, N. A. A., Kamaruddin, S. N. A. A., Abdullah, S. S., & Omar, K. (2023). Assessing wellbeing: Profiling and socioeconomic status of Kenyir Lake side community, Malaysia. *Heliyon*, 9(6), e16399. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e16399>
- Abi, M., Abdul, S., Zakaria, Z., Hasnan, T., & Muda, S. (2012). The Direction of Terengganu Tourism Industry in Sustaining Business Growth : A Conceptual Framework. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 2(4), 250–263. www.hrmar.com/journals
- Abror, A., Patrisia, D., Trinanda, O., Omar, M. W., & Wardi, Y. (2020). Antecedents of word of mouth in Muslim-friendly tourism marketing: the role of religiosity. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 12(4), 882–899. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-01-2020-0006>
- Afnarius, S., Akbar, F., & Yuliani, F. (2020). Developing web-based and mobile-based GIS for places of worship information to support halal tourism: A case study in Bukittinggi, Indonesia. *ISPRS International Journal of Geo-Information*, 9(1), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijgi9010052>
- Ainin, S., Feizollah, A., Anuar, N. B., & Abdullah, N. A. (2020). Sentiment analyses of multilingual tweets on halal tourism. *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 34(January 2019), 100658. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2020.100658>
- Al-Hamarneh, A., & Steiner, C. (2004). Islamic tourism: Rethinking the strategies of tourism development in the Arab world after September 11, 2001. *Comparative Studies of South Asia, Africa and the Middle East*, 24(1), 173–182. <https://doi.org/10.1215/1089201x-24-1-175>
- Andreastuti, S. D., Paripurno, E. T., Subandriyo, S., Syahbana, D. K., & Prayoga, A. S. (2023). Volcano disaster risk management during crisis: implementation of risk communication in Indonesia. *Journal of Applied Volcanology*, 12(1), 1–20. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13617-023-00129-2>
- Basrowi, Fauzi, & Utami, P. (2020). Impact of Sharia Tourism Development in Pringsewu Regency Lampung Lampung Province is known as a region with potential and tourist 2013 to 2017 the number of tourist arrivals in Lampung Province continued to increase . Where , the quite well . Based on th. *IQūshoduna: Jurnal Ekonomi Islam*, 9(1), 91–104. <https://doi.org/doi.org/10.36835/iqtishoduna.v9i1.473>
- Chookaew, S., Chanin, O., Charatarawat, J., Sriprasert, P., & Nimpaya, S. (2015). Increasing halal tourism potential at Andaman Gulf in Thailand for Muslim country. *Journal of Economics, Business and Management*, 3(7), 739–741.

- Dimas Satria, A., Ahmadi, S. I., & Hakiki, H. (2022). Halal Tourism Development in Lombok, Indonesia: A SWOT Analysis Citation: (2022) Halal Tourism Development in Lombok, Indonesia: A SWOT Analysis Halal Tourism and Pilgrimage. 2.2. Akbar et al., Halal Tourism Development in Lombok, Indonesia: A SWOT Analys. Halal Tourism and Pilgrimage, 2(2). <http://journals.smartinsight.id/index.php/HTP/index>
- Jaelani, A. (2017). Halal Tourism Industry in Indonesia: Potential and Prospects. *International Review of Management and Marketing*, 7(3), 25–34. <http://www.econjournals.com>
- Juliana, J., W. Mahri, A. J., Salsabilla, A. R., Muhammad, M., & Nusannas, I. S. (2023). The determinants of Muslim millennials' visiting intention towards halal tourist attraction. *Journal of Islamic Accounting and Business Research*, 14(3), 473–488. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIABR-02-2021-0044>
- Kemendagri. (2021). Statistik Kunjungan Wisatawan Mancanegara 2021. [Kemendagri.Go.Id](https://kemendagri.go.id/statistik-wisatawan-mancanegara/Statistik-Kunjungan-Wisatawan-Mancanegara-2021). <https://kemendagri.go.id/statistik-wisatawan-mancanegara/Statistik-Kunjungan-Wisatawan-Mancanegara-2021>
- Lestari, Y. D., Saidah, F., & Aliya Putri, A. N. (2023). Effect of destination competitiveness attributes on tourists' intention to visit halal tourism destination in Indonesia. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 14(4), 937–965. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-12-2020-0368>
- Miles, M., Huberman, M., & Saldaña, J. (2013). *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook: An Expanded Sourcebook*. 408. https://s3.amazonaws.com/academia.edu.documents/43491723/Miles_Huberman_Data_analysis.pdf?AWSAccessKeyId=AKIAIWOWYYGZ2Y53UL3A&Expires=1554078814&Signature=C9K75Fdt6SjvO4eGPjsP2ftcIb8%3D&response-content-disposition=inline%3Bfilename%3DMiles_Huberman_Da
- Mohezar, S., Moghavvemi, S., & Zailani, S. (2017). Malaysian Islamic medical tourism market: a SWOT analysis. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 8(3), 444–460. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-04-2015-0027>
- Muhamed, A. A., Ab Rahman, M. N., Mohd Hamzah, F., Che Mohd Zain, C. R., & Zailani, S. (2019). The impact of consumption value on consumer behaviour: A case study of halal-certified food supplies. *British Food Journal*, 121(11), 2951–2966. <https://doi.org/10.1108/BFJ-10-2018-0692>
- Mujahidin, M. (2020). The Potential Of Halal Industry In Indonesia To Support Economic Growth. *Al-Kharaj: Journal of Islamic Economic and Business*, 2(1), 77–90. <https://doi.org/10.24256/kharaj.v2i1.1433>
- Nurazizah, G. R., & Rahmafritra, F. (2021). Comparison Study of Domestic and Foreign Tourists' Perspective: the Standards and Product Values of Halal Tourism. *Plano Madani: Jurnal ...*, 10(April), 109–119. <http://journal.uin-alauddin.ac.id/index.php/planomadani/article/view/22979>
- Nurrachmi, R. (2019). Islamic Tourism: Factors that Influence Muslim Tourists and How to Promote Tourism in OIC Countries. In *Intra-trade in OIC* (Issue April, p. 131). Islamic Development Bank. https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Rininta-Nurrachmi/publication/332233977_Intra_Trade_in_OIC/links/5ca7ea35299bf118c4b58c2f/Intra-Trade-in-OIC.pdf#page=132
- Peristiwo, H. (2020). Indonesian and Malaysian potential for a halal tourism industry. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, 9(1), 1–16.
- Purnomo, E. P., Aditya, F., Fathani, A. T., Salsabila, L., & Rachmawati, D. (2021). Penta-Helix Approach as a Strategy to Recovery Tourism in Bali Due to Covid-19 Pandemic. *ACM International Conference Proceeding Series*, October, 122–127. <https://doi.org/10.1145/3484399.3484417>
- Purwandani, I., & Yusuf, M. (2021). Localizing Indonesian Halal tourism policy within local customs, Qanun, and marketing. *Journal of Policy Research in Tourism, Leisure and Events*, 0(0), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19407963.2021.1996382>
- Rehman, A. (2022). Halal Travel “2.0” and Beyond COVID-19. In *Strategic Islamic Marketing: A Roadmap for Engaging Muslim Consumers* (pp. 163–181). Springer International Publishing.
- Shafaki, R. El. (2022). State of the Global Islamic Economy Report: Unlocking Opportunity. In *State of the Global Islamic Economy Report 2020/21*. <https://haladinar.io/hdn/doc/report2018.pdf>
- Shirin Asa, R. (2019). an Overview of the Developments of Halal Certification Laws in Malaysia, Singapore, Brunei and Indonesia. *Jurnal Syariah*, 27(1), 173–200. <https://doi.org/10.22452/js.vol27no1.7>
- Subagyo, A., Handoko, R., & Wahyudi, H. (2022). Pentahelix Policy Management Paradigm as A Model for Disaster Management in Bojonegoro Regency East Java. *IJEBD (International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Business Development)*, 5(4), 739–750. <https://doi.org/10.29138/ijebd.v5i4.1906>
- Sugiyono. (2016). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D*. Alfabeta Bandung.
- Suryanto, T., Hayati, M., & Susanti, Y. (2022). The Potential of Halal Tourism System on Growth for the Province Lampung's Tourism Industry. *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism*, 13(6), 1616–1628. <https://www.journals.aserspublishing.eu/jemt/article/view/7274>
- Syamsuadi, A., Arisandi, D., Trisnawati, L., Hartati, S., & Elvitaria, L. (2022). A Model of Development Mitigation Disaster Based on Digital Eco-Tourism as a Prevention Effort of Forest and Land Fire Disaster Management. *Brawijaya Economics and Finance International Conference (BEFIC) 2022*, 5(2), 612.
- Syamsunasir, Anwar Kurniadi, & Widana, I. D. K. K. (2023). Pentahelix Synergy in Post-Tsunami Disaster Recovery to Support Community Resilience in Facing Disaster in Pandeglang Regency. *Technium Social Sciences Journal*, 42, 133–147. <https://techniumscience.com/index.php/socialsciences/article/view/8624/3180>

- Takeshita, S. (2020). Halal certification or ingredient disclosure: A comparative analysis of serving food in Japanese tourist destinations. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 11(3), 765–781. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-07-2018-0129>
- Wahyono, Z., & Razak, M. A. A. (2020). Islamic Tourism in Southeast Asia: The Concept and its Implementation. *International Journal of Halal Research*, 2(2), 90–105. <https://doi.org/10.18517/ijhr.2.2.90-105.2020>
- Wahyudin, U., Randa, A. R., El Karimah, K., & Santoso, I. M. (2022). The misunderstanding of halal tourism in Bandung city - Indonesia: Muslim tourist arrivals are increasing in the obscurity of concepts. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 13(12), 2611–2629. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-07-2020-0204>
- Wibawa, B. M., Pranindyasari, C., Bhawika, G. W., & Mardhotillah, R. R. (2023). Discovering the importance of halal tourism for Indonesian Muslim travelers: perceptions and behaviors when traveling to a non-Muslim destination. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 14(1), 61–81. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-07-2020-0210>
- Yagmur, Y., Ehtiyar, R., & Aksu, A. (2020). Evaluation of halal tourism in terms of bibliometric characteristics. *Evaluation of Halal Tourism Received*, 11(6), 1601–1617. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-05-2019-0101>
- Yasir, Y., Firzal, Y., Sulistyani, A., & Yesicha, C. (2021). Penta helix communication model through community based tourism (CBT) for tourism village development in Koto Sentajo, Riau, Indonesia. *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites*, 37(3), 851–860. <https://doi.org/10.30892/GTG.37316-718>.