Volume: 5 | Number 11 | pp. 5415 – 5430 ISSN: 2633-352X (Print) | ISSN: 2633-3538 (Online)

ijor.co.uk

DOI: https://doi.org/10.61707/cv1kf113

# Role of Strategic Planning in Enhancing Employees' Job Loyalty through Comprehensive Quality Management

Raed Hameed Naser AlShuwelate<sup>1</sup> and Ahmed Turki<sup>2</sup>

#### Abstract

Aims study to know the role of strategic planning in enhancing employee job loyalty with its through comprehensive quality management in the Training and Qualification Directorate, problem of the study lies in the extent of the directorate's interest, in strategic planning, employee job loyalty, and total quality management. A sample of officers, ranks, and civilian employees working in the directorate, The researchers relied on the questionnaire as a tool for collecting data and to complete this study and achieve the goals it seeks. (148) questionnaires were distributed to members of the study sample and the study reached a set of conclusions, the most important of which is the reliance of the directorate, the study community, on dialogue with workers before making decisions concerning them, which indicates its reliance on dialogue with workers before making a decision concerning them, the study reached of which is the necessity Coordination with universities and training and development centers in order to include the Directorate's employees in the courses on strategic planning

Keywords: Strategic Planning, Total Quality Management, Employee Loyalty

## **INTRODUCTION**

Strategic planning is considered one of the important topics after many productive organizations in general and service organizations in particular in all developed countries have adopted its application and have developed methods for working with it. In addition, the roots of strategic planning go back to the fifties of the last century, and it has been noted that the rate of failure in organizations that do not use it increases greatly. From those that use it, and it is considered one of the main functions of the administration and in view of the many developments that have occurred in the Directorate of Training and Qualification in the study community, as this Directorate works to pay attention to strategic planning to develop the training plans established in its development, Through diligent efforts to work on developing its administrative, training and study plans, since the Directorate, the study community, is specialized in clarifying the annual training plan that is drawn up for the directorates and departments of the Iraqi Ministry of Interior as a whole. The Directorate has been interested in developing plans that develop its work, and this is what achieves the main goal that the Directorate aims to achieve. The study aims to achieve job loyalty for employees in the directorate, the study community, and by centering comprehensive quality.

## STUDY METHODOLOGY

**A - The exploratory study and the problem of the study:** The solution to a problem lies in the knowledge of the dimensions of the problem itself, and the methodology of the study is the road map for any researcher because it determines his path and what the study should be on, regarding the behavior and variables of the phenomenon that is being researched in order to understand and comprehend the problem of the study, which was described as half The path to the solution.

The first section aims to clarify the methodology adopted in the study, and the problem of the current study is summarized by a question that represents the presentation of this problem, as shown in the following question:

- (What is the impact of the role of strategic planning in enhancing the job loyalty of employees through

PhD student, Department of Business Administration, Faculté des Sciences Economiques et de Gestion University of Sfax E-mail: raed.h.n.82@gmail.com

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Associate Professor of Business Administration, Institute of Higher Commercial studies University of Sfax Tunisia

comprehensive quality management as an intermediary variable in the Training and Qualification Directorate, the study population).

Contemporary administrative thought, in recognition of the intellectual dilemma, has sought, since the end of the last century and the beginning of the current century, to study many theses related to it. The most important thing it addresses is the attempt to provide an introduction to adopting an integrative model for smart organizations, which has received great attention among organizations and their various orientations, and modern administrative thought has also taken its interest. And its orientations towards comprehensive quality management represented by (quality management system and organizational climate, administrative leadership's commitment to comprehensive quality, employee integration and training on quality, strategic planning for quality, management of production processes, and continuous improvement of quality) for the effective role in the continuity and success of training organizations in the modern era.

It is viewed as the true representative of the organization's ability to achieve success, because it represents the organization's latent capabilities, and these capabilities that organizations possess cannot be easily imitated by some other training organizations, and on the basis of what emerged from these perceptions about the role of strategic planning in enhancing the Job loyalty For employees through comprehensive quality management, and because of the intense competition that organizations face, especially organizations specialized in the field of training, as they currently face several difficulties, including those related to the quality of their performance or threats (global training organizations), they face fundamental challenges that weaken their ability to meet The needs and desires of the trainees.

In addition to that, identifying the ability of the Training and Qualification Directorate in Baghdad under study to convince trainees of the services provided, through the use and reuse of concepts and the exclusion of the main variables of the study, and this in turn is reflected in identifying and clarifying the relationship between strategic planning and employee job loyalty through comprehensive quality management. This is of great importance to the problem of the field study.

**B - Objectives of the study**: The main objective of the current study is to verify the relationship and influence between (strategic planning, employees' job loyalty, and total quality management), Through the problem of the study and its importance, and more specifically, the current study sought to achieve a set of theoretical and field objectives, the most important of which is formulated based on what some researchers in administrative thought have reached with regard to the variables of the study by diagnosing the role and importance of strategic planning in the Qualification Training Directorate and testing the level of influence Strategic planning and total quality management in the job loyalty of employees, and defining and diagnosing total quality management through the relative importance of its exclusion, as well as providing an information base for individuals interested in the subject of the study and the directorate. The study sample is considered a supporting force for their future vision towards building and strengthening the management of the Comprehensive approach to be able to achieve Job loyalty of employees.

**C - The importance of the study:** The importance of this study is of two types and two levels, which are the scientific level and the applied level, and as explained, this is a study that follows the scientific importance of the variables of the study because they are important to the organizations, which are the strategic planning variable, the employees' job loyalty variable, and the comprehensive quality management variable, by reviewing According to the researchers' previous studies, these three variables have not been dealt with previously, and they are combined in one study. This is according to the researchers' knowledge and knowledge.

This is what makes the researchers in this study search for this scientific research gap, and this study is applied in (the Directorate of Rehabilitation Training, one of the formations of the Ministry's Agency for Administrative and Financial Affairs - the Iraqi Ministry of Interior), as this directorate is responsible for providing training and educational services to employees of the Ministry of Interior. Iraqi, and therefore it is necessary to take care of the workers, and try to solve some of the obstacles and difficulties facing them, and this is what contributes to developing immediate and difficult solutions, and in turn the issue is reflected in a good and positive way on the reality of the employees of this organization.

- **D** Study hypotheses: In our current study, we rely on the main and subsidiary hypotheses that achieve its goals, and test its hypothetical plan, and in harmony with the intellectual data of the current study and to achieve its goals and answer its questions, the following hypotheses have been developed: -
- 1 The first main hypothesis: There is no significant correlation between strategic planning and total quality management by its dimensions.
- 2 The second main hypothesis: There is no significant correlation between strategic planning and employees' job loyalty if it is excluded.
- 3 The third main hypothesis: There is no significant correlation between comprehensive quality management and employees' job loyalty if it is removed.
- 4 The fourth main hypothesis: There is no significant effect of strategic planning in comprehensive quality management by eliminating it.
- 5- The fifth main hypothesis: There is no significant effect of strategic planning on the job loyalty of employees by removing it.
- 6- The sixth main hypothesis: There is no significant effect of comprehensive quality management on the job loyalty of employees by removing it.
- 7- The seventh main hypothesis: Total quality management does not mediate the relationship between strategic planning and employees' job loyalty.
- 8- The eighth main hypothesis: The organization and the study community do not differ in adopting the variables of the current study.
- E The hypothetical plan for the study: The design of the hypothetical plan for the study was done according to what came from a survey of the intellectual results of the scientific literature related to the variables of the study, as the plan presented an expressive picture of the idea of the study, and clarifies the nature of the relationships and directions of influence between its variables, as the hypothetical plan for the study consists of the three variables.

Figure (1) shows the hypothetical plan for the study, which was created on the basis of the study problem and its requirements.

## Mediating variable Comprehensive Quality Management Quality management system and organizational climate, administrative leadership commitment to comprehensive quality, employee integration and training on quality, management of production processes, continuous improvement of quality Independent variable Strategic Planning Dependent variable Strategic culture Emotional job loyalty Relationship Strategic vision Influence. Continuing job loyalty Strategic decisions relationship Normative job loyalty association Environmental analysis

Figure No. (1) Hypothetical outline of the study

Source: Prepared by the researchers based on administrative literature

#### THE THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK OF THE STUDY

#### 1- Strategic Planning

- A The concept of strategic planning: There are many researchers who have addressed the variable of strategic planning, as this concept began in the fifth century BC with the Greeks, who used it to develop their urban countries. It was stated that in some countries, strategic planning is desirable to improve the quality of public services and to ensure communication. Internal development in public organizations, while many countries' understanding of strategic planning is usually to achieve desired goals and objectives as a means of ensuring coordination However, in some countries, strategic planning is considered a monitoring mechanism for public spending in order to use resources more, as well as the possibility of including prominent countries that have applied strategic planning as an innovative administrative system, as strategic planning was implemented by these countries depending on the administrative structure of the state and the federal level, As well as the levels of central and local government (Ministry of Development, 2015), The researchers (Khaled and Al-Ani, 2018: 314) indicated that it is the administrative concept represented by changes in all components of the organization from within it to know the points of weakness and strength, in addition to that, analyzing external variables surrounding the organization, represented by threats and opportunities, to help it formulate its goals, which the organization aspires to reach over a period of time. A well-planned period of time with the resources you have, whether now or in the future.
- **B**. The importance of strategic planning: The importance of strategic planning can be explained from four points of view, namely (environmental scanning, strategy formulation, linking goals to budgets, and strategic planning as a process). Research has shown that strategic planning can be effective in improving organizational that strategic planning can achieve goals and work to harmonize the organization's energy, resources, and activities, to work towards a common goal, which is meeting the future needs of employees that meet the needs of the organization. The organization as for the researchers, they view strategic planning as important for organizations because it puts them on the right path according to a thoughtful action plan whose implementation is supervised by senior management in order to contribute to the success of the organization.
- **C. Strategic planning models and theories: -** There is a group of models and theories that a group of researchers talked about regarding the variable of strategic planning, including the following: (Bin Ahmed, 2017: 30-33)
- **. Linear model**: This model is based on the integration of decisions, actions, actions and plans in order to achieve the goals that were determined by the organization's senior management.
- . Competitive model: This model focuses on the future of the organization, as its future is conditional on the competitive forces surrounding it, and this pushes it to deal with human resources in the competitive environment, bargain with customers and alternative products, and compete with suppliers, new competitors, and existing similar organizations.
- . Pfeiffer Model: Strategic planning is based on this model and is the gateway to improving the organization and its success. It calls for relying on a scientific method, and it contains (environmental auditing and examination) and (applied considerations). These two types contain nine steps to complete the plan.
- **D. Dimensions of strategic planning**: In light of the changes and developments and the rapid circumstances that the world is witnessing, and for the success of the strategic planning process in organizations, there must be dimensions of the strategic planning variable to achieve success, as researchers differ in their opinions in dealing with the issue of the main dimensions of strategic planning, due to the lack of agreed upon standards in In this regard, some of them have addressed it in a detailed and precise manner, and the researchers in their current study adopted the researchers' model (Al-Attar and Shaltagh, 2020: 41-50) with the following four dimensions: (strategic culture, strategic vision, strategic decisions, environmental analysis). Below is an explanation of each dimension. Among these dimensions:-
- . Strategic culture: The researchers (Qawasmeh, et.al, 2013:7) defined it as an expression of the values, standards and beliefs that are shared by employees working in the organization, and it is often defined in a

broad scope called common values, beliefs, ideology and standards held by the members of the organization and which affect the Their behavior.

- . Strategic vision: It is a concept that reflects the future outlook that the organization thinks and aspires to achieve and reach. It represents the ambition on which the executive director or strategic director focuses and encourages members of the organization around it, and it embodies the perceptions and aspirations of the organization so that it shows what it wants to achieve and reach in The end, as explained by researcher (Lynch .2015: 201), is that the concept of strategic vision is a challenging image, imaginative of the future role and goal and going to a large extent outside its environment and the current competitive situation.
- . Strategic decisions: One of the complex matters for the organization is anticipating and analyzing future developments due to the increasing difficulties in the external environment. Therefore, it has the need to prepare to confront the spreading danger and threat and work to exploit opportunities in the potential future. The researcher (David 2016: 16) has known (strategic decisions). He described it as the organization's ability to develop the ability to recognize trends and uncertainties in the future, understand them and respond to them.
- . Environmental analysis: The researcher (Esmaeili, 2014: 1046) indicated that it is the process of collecting environmental data, analyzing and processing it, and presenting it in a way that helps decision makers make their decisions with the required efficiency and effectiveness. In addition, environmental analysis includes all the organization's operations related to administrative, financial, human affairs, Legal.

#### 2- Employee loyalty

- A- The Concept of job loyalty for Employees: Job loyalty is one of the matters that most occupy the minds of organizations, because it is responsible for maintaining the organization in a healthy and sound state that enables it to survive. Job loyalty for employees is one of the main issues for measuring the extent of compatibility between employees and organizations. The researchers (Kazim and Fadli, 2020: 80) explained that the concept of job loyalty is the state of feeling of the working employee towards the organization in which he works and the extent to which his goals and values are in harmony with the organization's goal and values and the extent of his complete readiness to offer his time, energy and effort for the benefit of the organization at the expense of his personal interest and desire. In staying in it to work and exerting all his energies and effort for it, the working employee who has the quality of loyalty has the quality of acceptance of the organization's goals. Researchers (Sadiq et al., 2016: 149) believe that job loyalty is the readiness of the working employee to exert the highest levels of effort for the benefit of the organization and the high desire to remain in it, and acceptance of the main goals and values of the organization. It means the employee's association with his management in an informal manner that is not subject to recognized laws and regulations., The researchers explained that job loyalty is defined as the feelings that a working employee who lives in a society develops towards workers and organizations, and the principles, values, ideas and feelings usually represent the desire of the workers and their willingness to make sacrifices for their friends and their organization at work, and are represented by the reaction of the workers towards the characteristics of the organization to which they belong (Saleh and Abdullah, 2021).: 397).
- B The importance and objectives of job loyalty for employees: The topic of job loyalty for employees has become one of the important topics and has received wide attention from researchers. The importance can be summarized in several points mentioned by the researchers in the following (Al-Mousawi and Abboud, 2020: 206-207)
- . Job loyalty appears as an important element in the link between the organization and the individuals working in it, especially in times when organizations give appropriate rewards and incentives to push the working employees to work and provide the greatest amount of achievement.
- . The loyalty of employees to the organization in which they work is a more important factor than job satisfaction in predicting whether they will continue their work or leave their work and move to other organizations.

- . The researchers view the importance of employees' job loyalty as presenting the interest of the organization in which they work over their personal interests and working hard and defending it to ensure the continuity of its work.
- **C Factors affecting employees' job loyalty:** There is a group of factors that affect employees' loyalty to the organization, among which the researchers (Mohamed and Mahmoud, 2019: 364-365) are as follows:
- . Incentive system: It is an internal force and feeling that drives the behavior of employees to satisfy specific needs and desires. So, at the time when an individual worker feels that he has a need, he wants to satisfy it. The need causes tension that leads to exerting effort on the part of the employees, and in turn, the effort expended leads to satisfaction and achieving satisfaction. The search for new needs, and incentives, has an effective role in strengthening relations between the organization and the individuals working in it.
- Organizational climate: It is the internal work environment with its various characteristics, variables, and interactions. This climate plays an important role in determining the ethical and functional behavior of employees, in terms of modifying, shaping, and changing the habits, trends, values, and behavior of individuals. This climate varies from one organization to another depending on the experiences, service, and prevailing values of the organization.
- . **Job satisfaction:** It has a significant impact on the organization, the workers, and their achievements. There are many studies that cover aspects of satisfaction with the organization and its relationship to the various factors present in the work environment, as well as the impact of satisfaction and dissatisfaction on the behavior of workers in organizations.
- . Leadership style: The important thing for the administrative leader is that he is able to create loyalty among the working individuals, and he expresses that without loyalty the manager's position is shaken, as loyalty is considered a two-way road, the first is the working individuals offering their loyalty to the manager and the second is the manager offering his loyalty to his subordinates.
- **D** Dimensions of job loyalty for employees: There are many and different names in the administrative literature regarding the dimensions of job loyalty for employees, and in light of the changes that the world is witnessing, and to apply the process of job loyalty for employees in organizations, there must be dimensions of the variable to achieve success, as researchers differ in their opinions in dealing with the topic of the main dimensions. For the variable of employee job loyalty, the following is an explanation of the researchers' dimensions (Radwan, 2016: 30-31)
- **. Emotional job loyalty:** This dimension is called emotional and emotional, and it expresses the degree of attachment of the individuals working with the organization psychologically and emotionally. It is affected by the extent to which the working individuals realize the distinct characteristics of their work, such as independence, acquisition of skills, and the nature of their relationship with their supervisors. They are also affected by the nature of the organizational environment in which they work (Al-Salem, 2015: 53), and the researchers (Souissi, 2018: 135) stated that emotional loyalty is the employee's feeling of connection to the organization, and this is affected by the extent to which the employee realizes the distinct characteristics of the work, such as independence, acquisition of skills, and the nature of the relationship with supervisors, and is also affected by the degree of the employee's feeling that the environment The organization he works for allows participation Effective in the decision-making process.
- Continuing job loyalty: The researcher (Salman) refers to side bets and investments that indicate an estimate of knowing the level of balance between the effort expended (costs) and the reward that the working employee receives as a result of his work completion. He stressed that continuous job loyalty develops by relying on two basic factors, which are an increase in investments Side bets and the lack of available alternatives (Saleh and Abdullah, 2021, 399). As for the researchers in their current study, they see the concept of continuing job loyalty as the satisfaction of the employee working with the organization in which he works. If it is positive, he decides to continue with it and gives his best, even if it is negative. He may decide to work for another organization if there are better opportunities in other organizations.

. Normative job loyalty: The researchers (Owais, 2019: 90) explained that this dimension reflects the employee's moral feeling of remaining in the organization, and his keenness to put the organization's interest ahead of his personal interest and stay away from conflicts with the remaining employees working in the organization. The researchers exp (Allen & Mater) It is a sense of moral obligation to remain in the organization that comes from the values that workers acquired before joining their work, that is, from the family or after joining the organization through organizational normalization, after which the employees' behavior is a reflection of what they feel and what they believe to be ethical (Al-Kalabi and Khader, 2021: 149)

# **Total Quality Management**

A-The concept of total quality management: The concept of establishing total quality management goes back to the American researchers Dr. Edward Deming, as his ideas began to spread in many countries, especially in Japan, as they were applied in most service and industrial organizations, by investing in these ideas to produce A Japanese model of quality, as the beginnings of total quality management go back to the scientist (Frederick Taylor), which revolves around focusing on work and improving performance, and it is considered a theory (Max Weber) that is concerned with the structural aspect of organizations, as well as the fact that it distributes tasks and divides jobs (Hajji, 2022: 344)

(Arifin et al., 2022:18) stated that total quality management is implemented by integrating all current functions in the organization, which were formed based on the concept of teamwork, productivity, understanding, and customer satisfaction. Total quality management is defined as a modern management philosophy whose goal is continuous improvement for all departments and operations. And also creating a new culture based on making changes in order to achieve goals effectively, whether through values, systems, or administrative methods.

B - The importance and objectives of total quality management: The importance of applying total quality management in organizations is important as it is one of the main stages of improving the performance of all organizations in general and industrial ones in particular and providing high quality that results in achieving customer satisfaction because it is the key to success for any organization. Moreover, The nature of high competition between industrial organizations, which requires understanding what the customer wants, providing his needs, and satisfying his desires at the lowest possible cost and on time.

This helps in reducing their complaints and providing them with the best services, thus increasing customer satisfaction, reducing the percentage of errors and defects in the organization's services, increasing profitability, and attracting new customers who are willing to pay more in exchange for obtaining a service of distinctive and high quality. The application of comprehensive quality management also contributes to achieving loyalty among employees and improving precedence. The competitiveness of the organization (77 2020: Obeidat & Alsaffar).

C - Requirements and dimensions of the application of total quality management: - The researchers conducted a group of studies and research, on the basis of which the majority of these applications developed, and at the level of countries of the world, east and west, taking into account the brevity. As for the researchers in their current study, they adopted a model (Al-Barzanji, 2022: 114 - 121) Which is represented by the following:- (Quality management system and organizational climate, administrative leadership's commitment to comprehensive quality, employee integration and training on quality, management of production processes, continuous improvement of quality)

The applications in which the basic values and concepts were used indicated that the employees working in charge of comprehensive quality management received a set of lessons and lessons, the most important of which is acquiring the skill directed towards building a quality-based organization. The main set of values is represented in the requirements and dimensions of the comprehensive quality management system, which the researcher (Al-Barzanji 2022: 114 - 121) which is represented by the following:-

. Quality Management System and Organizational Climate: The subject of quality means verifying that specific objectives may be achieved by means of information obtained from the performance results achieved for operations. It is believed that a good organizational climate prepares employees psychologically to accept and adopt comprehensive quality, which reduces their resistance to changes and provides Ways to ensure its success.

- . Administrative leadership's commitment to comprehensive quality: Administrative leaders must disseminate information about anything related to comprehensive quality management efforts and make it clear that they are not just slogans, but rather ideas are created around them on an ongoing basis and they are encouraged to implement them and action comes based on their requirements. Administrative leadership must establish unity of purpose and determine the necessary direction. The organization must follow it.
- . Integration of employees and their training on quality: Employees need training to show how to reallocate their time to their operations, search for problems, and address their causes. If the right thing is done the first time, the problems that create the need that need to be inspected for failure will disappear. Education and training are essential for total quality management. Because they represent the best way to develop employees.
- . Management of production processes: activities that create value in the form of goods and services by converting inputs into outputs (Heizer et al: 4, 2017), and processes must facilitate performing tasks correctly from the first act, and this requires identifying the place where errors are likely to occur. To try to prevent it so that it is less likely to happen again, the process is designed in a way that makes it almost impossible for workers to do anything wrong (Stevenson 2018: 391).
- . Continuous quality improvement: A process that is developed in quality management applications, as it initially requires the stability of ongoing processes, and this is what makes them predictable and their ability to be easy to reach the state of analysis and then improvement. Continuous improvement appears through three stages (participation, balance, and improvement), and information technology helps to redesign the administrative process.

## The Practical Aspect

# 1-Testing the Study Tool

**A - Confirmatory factor analysis of the strategic planning variable**: In order to verify the issue of structural validity of the current study scale and its accuracy in the field, the researchers in their current study used confirmatory factor analysis, taking advantage of the statistical program (AMOS, 24), noting that model conformity indicators were adopted. Recommended by (Hair etal, 2010).

Table (1) shows that the confirmatory factor analysis of the independent variable strategic planning, after making modifications to the model and based on the Modification Index's, consists of four dimensions and (20) questions. In addition, it is noted that the standard saturations (Standardized Estimations) appearing on the arrows linking the latent variables (Latent variables) with the measured variables (Observed variables) were within the acceptable ratio of (0.40), noting that the critical value (Critical ratio) for these saturations exceeded (1.96), which means their significance is at the level of (5%). Model fit indices were within acceptable limits.

# B - Confirmatory factor analysis of the total quality management variable:

Table (1) shows that the confirmatory factor analysis of the comprehensive quality management variable, after making modifications to the model and based on the indicators (Modification Index's), consists of five sub-dimensions and (27) questions, as questions (1, 7, 17, and 18) were deleted because they were not achieved. The required saturation: It is noted that the standard saturations (Standardized Estimations) appearing on the arrows linking the latent variables (Latent variables) with the measured variables (Observed variables) for the rest of the questions were within the acceptable ratio of (0.40), noting that the critical value (Critical ratio) for these saturations It exceeded (1.96), which means its significance was at the level of (5%), noting that the model fit indicators were within acceptable limits.

**C -Confirmatory factor analysis of the job loyalty variable:** Table No. (1) below shows that the confirmatory factor analysis of the employee job loyalty variable, after making modifications to the model and based on the modification indicators (Modification Index's), consists of three dimensions and (13) questions after deleting Question (11) It is noted that the standard saturations (Standardized Estimations) appearing on the arrows linking the latent variables (Latent variables) with the measured variables (Observed variables) for the rest of

the questions were within the acceptable ratio of (0.40), noting that the critical value (Critical ratio) for this the Saturations exceeded (1.96), which means their significance was at the level of (5%), and the model fit indicators were within acceptable limits.

Table: (1) Model fit criteria for the three variables.

Confirmatory factor analysis of Variable	Values of indicators of model fit with data Standardized Chi-Square (CMINDF) cmindf 2.03
Strategic Planning	Goodness of fit index (GFI) GFI 93
	Comparative fit index (CFI) CFI 95
	Incremental Fit Index (IFI) IFI 94
	Locker & Lewis Index (TLI) TLI 90
	Root mean square error of approximation
	(RMSEA) RMSEA 067
Confirmatory factor analysis of the variable	Values of indicators of model fit with data
	Standardized Chi-Square (CMINDF) cmindf 2.22
Employee loyalty	Goodness of Fit Index (GFI) GFI 92
	Comparative Conformity Index (CFI) CFI 89
	Incremental Conformity Index (IFI) IFI 91
	Locker & Lewis Index (TLI) TLI 95
	Root mean square error of approximation
	(RMSEA) RMSEA055
Confirmatory factor analysis of Variable	Values of indicators of model fit with data
Total Quality Management	Standardized Chi-Square (CMINDF) cmindf 3.22
	Goodness of Fit Index (GFI) GFI 89
	Comparative Conformity Index (CFI) CFI 90
	Incremental Conformity Index (IFI) IFI 95
	Locker & Lewis Index (TLI) TLI 89
	Root mean square error of approximation
	(RMSEA) RMSEA 082

Source: Prepared by the researchers based on administrative literature.

2. Validity and stability of the study tool: One of the most important measures used to measure the stability of the questionnaire is the (Cronbach's Alpha) measure. The researchers' aim of using this type of analysis is to ensure that the measure will give the same results if the experiment is repeated again on the same sample, noting that (Urasachi et al (2015:681) point out that in the behavioral sciences, when the value of the reliability coefficient is (0.60), it is considered an acceptable value, and Table No. (2) below shows the values of the Alpha Chronbach's test for the variables of the study.

Table: (2) Reliability coefficient values for the study variables

Ser.	Dimensions	Coefficient values of Cronbach's Alpha		
1.	Strategic Planning	0.62		
2.	Total Quality Management	0.85		
3.	Employee loyalty	0.80		

Source: Prepared by the researchers based on administrative literature.

It is clear from Table (2) that all values of the coefficients (Cronbach's Alpha) are within statistically acceptable limits, which makes the researchers reassured about the results that will be reached.

**3: Testing the study hypotheses:** For the purpose of testing the hypotheses of the correlation relationships between the study variables, the researchers used the correlation matrix (simple correlation coefficients.

## A - Testing the correlations between the study variables

. The first main hypothesis: (There is no significant correlation between strategic planning and comprehensive quality management by its dimensions).

Table No. (3) shows the correlation matrix for the first main hypothesis that all correlations were positive and morally significant at the (1%) level between The strategic planning variable and the total quality management variable with its dimensions. The strongest correlation was between strategic planning and leadership

commitment to quality, reaching (0.426), while the weakest correlation was between strategic planning and management of production operations, reaching (0.290).

At the overall level, the correlation between strategic planning and total quality management reached (0.664), which is a significant relationship at the level of (1%). The above results indicate the rejection of the first main hypothesis, meaning (there is a significant correlation between strategic planning and total quality management in its dimensions), This indicates that the directorate is the study community and the more it supports and strengthens strategic planning in it, the more this leads to improving the level of comprehensive quality management in it.

Table: (3) Matrix of correlation coefficients between strategic planning and total quality management, with its dimensions

Independen t	Organizational Climate	Leadership Commitment to Quality	Employee Integration and Training	Production Operations Management	Continuous Improvement	Total Quality Management
Strategic Planning	0.346	0.426	0.413	0.290	0.384	0.664
Sig	.000	.000	.000	.000	.000	.000
N	148	148	148	148	148	148

Source: Prepared by the researchers based on administrative literature.

The second main hypothesis: (There is no significant correlation between strategic planning and employees' job loyalty beyond its dimensions). Table (4) shows the correlation matrix for the second main hypothesis that all correlations were positive and morally significant at the (1%) level between the planning variable. Strategic planning and the employee job loyalty variable by its dimensions. The strongest correlation was between strategic planning and standard job loyalty, reaching (0.446). The weakest correlation was between strategic planning and continuing job loyalty, reaching (0.402). At the overall level, the correlation between strategic planning and employees' job loyalty reached (0.636), which is a significant relationship at the level of (1%). The above results indicate the rejection of the second main hypothesis, meaning (there is a significant correlation between strategic planning and employees' job loyalty, regardless of its dimensions). This indicates that the directorate is the study community and the more it supports and strengthens strategic planning in it, the more this will lead to improving the level of job loyalty of its employee

Table: (4) Matrix of correlation coefficients between strategic planning and employees' job loyalty, regardless of its dimensions

Independent	Certified	Emotional job loyalty	Continuing job loyalty	Normative job loyalty	Employee loyalty
Strategic Planning		0.416	0.402	0.446	0.636
Sig		.000	.000	.000	.000
N		148	148	148	148

Source: Prepared by the researchers based on administrative literature

The third main hypothesis: (There is no significant correlation between total quality management and employee job loyalty, regardless of its dimensions). Table (5) shows the correlation matrix for the second main hypothesis that all correlations were positive and morally significant at the level of (5% and 1%). Between the variable of comprehensive quality management and the variable of employee job loyalty, by its dimensions

The strongest correlation was between total quality management and emotional job loyalty, reaching (0.495), while the weakest correlation was between total quality management and emotional job loyalty, reaching (0.174), which is a significant relationship at the level of (5%). At the overall level, the correlation reached Between total quality management and job loyalty of employees (0.473), which is a significant relationship at the level of (1%). The above results indicate the rejection of the third main hypothesis, meaning (there is a significant correlation between total quality management and job loyalty of employees, regardless of its dimensions), this indicates

that the directorate is the study community, and the more it supports and strengthens comprehensive quality management in it, the more this leads to improving the level of job loyalty

Table: (5) Matrix of correlation coefficients between strategic planning and employees' job loyalty, including its dimensions

Independent	Certified	Emotional job loyalty	Continuing job loyalty	Normative job loyalty	Employee loyalty
Strategic Planning		0.174	0.495	0.216	0.473
Sig		.034	.000	.008	.000
N		148	148	148	148

Source: Prepared by the researchers based on administrative literature.

B - Testing the hypotheses of influence between the variables of the study: The researchers used simple regression analysis for the purpose of testing the hypotheses of influence emerging from the study, as follows: .The fourth main hypothesis: (There is no significant effect of strategic planning on comprehensive quality management in its dimensions.

Table (6) below shows the analysis of the fourth main hypothesis.

Table: (6) Analysis of the influence relationships for the fourth main hypothesis

Independent variable  Dependent variable	Strategic Planning		calculated t value and its significance level	calculated F value and its significance level	coefficient of determination R2
Organizational climate	A	В			
	-0.133	1.08	4.45**	19.81**	0.12
Leadership commitment to	-0.055	1.02	5.68**	32.35**	0.18
quality					
Employee integration and	0.195	1.08	5.47**	29.97**	0.17
training					
Performing production	-0.14	1.13	3.66**	13.41**	0.08
operations					
Continuous improvement	-0.001	1.18	5.03**	25.29**	0.15
Total Quality Management	-0.022	0.915	10.72**	114.92**	0.44

Source: Prepared by the researchers based on administrative literature.

A - The directorate's interest in the research community in strengthening its organizational climate will increase by (1.08) if the interest in strategic planning in the aforementioned directorate is increased by one unit, which is a significant effect at the level of (1%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached (4.45, While the value of (F), which measures the significance of the regression model, was (19.81), which is a significant value at the level of (1%), the explanatory power of the regression model was (0.12), indicating that the strategic planning dimension explains (12%) of the changes that occur in the organizational climate.

**B** - The interest of senior management in the research community in quality is enhanced by (1.02) if its interest in strategic planning in the aforementioned directorate increases by one unit, which is a significant effect at the level of (1%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached ((5.68), while The value of (F), which measures the significance of the regression model, was (32.35), which is a significant value at the level of (1%). The explanatory power of the regression model was (0.18), which means that the strategic planning dimension explains (18%) of the changes that occur in Senior management's commitment to quality.

C- The integration and training of quality workers in the research community can be increased by (1.08) if the directorate's interest in strategic planning increases by one unit, which is a significant effect at the level of (1%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached ((5.74, While the value of (F), which measures the significance of the regression model, was (29.97), which is a significant value at the level of (1%), and the explanatory power of the regression model was (0.17), which means that the strategic planning

<sup>\*\*</sup> Significant at the level of (1%), as can be seen from the table above:

dimension explains (17%) of the changes that occur. In integrating employees and training them regarding quality

- **D** The performance of production operations in the research community will improve by (1.13) if the directorate's interest in strategic planning increases by one unit, which is a significant effect at the level of (1%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached ((3.66), while the value of (F) which measures the significance of the regression model (13.41), which is a significant value at the level of (1%). The explanatory power of the regression model was (0.08), which means that the strategic planning dimension explains (8%) of the changes that occur in the performance of production operations.
- E-Whenever the directorate pays one unit more attention to the research community in its strategic planning, its performance in the field of continuous quality improvement will increase by (1.18), which is a significant effect at the level of (1%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached (5.03), while it reached (5.03). The value of (F), which measures the significance of the regression model, is (25.29), which is a significant value at the level of (1%). The explanatory power of the regression model was (0.15), meaning that the strategic planning dimension explains (15%) of the changes that occur in continuous improvement.
- F- In general, whenever one unit of attention is paid to strategic planning, this will enhance comprehensive quality management by (0.915), which is a significant effect at the level of (1%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached ((10.72), while it reached (10.72). The value of (F), which measures the significance of the regression model, is (114.29), which is a significant value at the level of (1%). The explanatory power of the regression model was (0.44), which means that the strategic planning dimension explains (44%) of the changes that occur in management. Total quality, and from the advanced analysis, the researchers conclude that the main hypothesis is rejected, meaning (there is a significant effect of strategic planning on total quality management in its dimensions).

**Fifth Main Hypothesis:** (There is no significant effect of strategic planning on employees' job loyalty in all its dimensions).

Table (7) below shows the analysis of the fifth main hypothesis.

Independent variable  Dependent variable	Strateg Plannir		calculated t value and its significance level	calculated F value and its significance level	coefficient of determination R2
Emotional job loyalty	A	В			
	0.400	1.00	5.53**	30.60**	0.17
Continuing job loyalty	-0.71	1.25	5.30**	28.09**	0.16
Standard job loyalty	-0.27	1.08	6.02**	36.32**	0.20
Job lovalty of employees	-0.19	1.11	9.95**	99.05**	0.40

Table: (7) Analysis of the influence relationships for the fourth main hypothesis

Source: Prepared by the researchers based on administrative literature.

- \*\* Significant at the level of (1%), as can be seen from the following table
- A The emotional job loyalty among employees in the directorate under investigation will increase by (1.00) if interest in strategic planning in the aforementioned directorate is increased by one unit, which is a significant effect at the level of (1%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached ((5.53, while the value of (F), which measures the significance of the regression model, was (30.60), which is a significant value at the level of (1%), and the explanatory power of the regression model was (0.17), which means that the strategic planning dimension explains (17%) of the changes which occurs in the emotional job loyalty of employees.
- **B** Continuing job loyalty among workers in the research community is enhanced by (1.25) if their interest in strategic planning increases by one unit. This is a significant effect at the level of (1%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached (5.30), while the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached (5.30). (F), which measures the significance of the regression model (28.09), which is a significant value at the level of (1%). The explanatory power of the regression model was (0.16), which means

that the strategic planning dimension explains (16%) of the changes that occur in job loyalty continuity among employees.

C - Standard job loyalty among workers in the research community can be increased by (1.08) if the directorate's interest in strategic planning increases by one unit, which is a significant effect at the level of (1%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached (6.02, while The value of (F), which measures the significance of the regression model, was (36.32), which is a significant value at the level of (1%), and the explanatory power of the regression model was (0.20), which means that the strategic planning dimension explains (20%) of the changes that occur in Standard job loyalty of employees.

**D** - In general, whenever one unit of attention is paid to strategic planning, this will enhance job loyalty among employees by an amount of (1.11), which is a significant effect at the level of (1%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached (9.95), while The value of (F), which measures the significance of the regression model, was (99.05), which is a significant value at the level of (1%), and the explanatory power of the regression model was (0.40), which means that the strategic planning dimension explains (40%) of the changes that occur in Job loyalty of employees, and from the advanced analysis, the researchers infer the rejection of the fourth main hypothesis, meaning (there is a significant effect of strategic planning on job loyalty of employees in its dimensions)

The sixth main hypothesis: (There is no significant effect of total quality management on employees' job loyalty in its dimensions). Table (8) below shows the analysis of the sixth main hypothesis.

Independent variable  Dependent variable	Strategic Planning		Calculated t value and its significance level	Calculated F value and its significance level	Coefficient of determination R2
Emotional job loyalty	A	В			
	2.62	0.31	2.13*	4.56*	0.03
Continuing job loyalty	0.007	1.12	6.88**	47.40**	0.24
Standard job loyalty	1.96	0.38	2.68**	7.17**	0.05
Job loyalty of	1.53	0.60	6.49**	42.15**	0.22

Table: (8) Analysis of the influence relationships for the fourth main hypothesis

Source: Prepared by the researchers based on administrative literature.

A - The emotional job loyalty among employees in the directorate under investigation will increase by (0.30) if interest in comprehensive quality management in the aforementioned directorate is increased by one unit, which is a significant effect at the level of (5%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached ((2.13, while the value of (F), which measures the significance of the regression model, was (4.56), which is a significant value at the level of (5%). The explanatory power of the regression model was (0.03), which means that total quality management explains (3%) of Changes that occur in employees' emotional job loyalty.

**B** - Continuing job loyalty among employees in the research community is enhanced by (1.12) if their interest in comprehensive quality management increases by one unit, which is a significant effect at the level of (1%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached (6.88), while it reached The value of (F), which measures the significance of the regression model, is (47.40), which is a significant value at the level of (1%). The explanatory power of the regression model was (0.24), meaning total quality management explains (24%) of the changes that occur in continuity of job loyalty for employees.

C - Standard job loyalty among workers in the research community can be increased by (0.38) if the directorate's interest in comprehensive quality management increases by one unit, which is a significant effect at the level of (1%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached ((2.86, While the value of (F), which measures the significance of the regression model, was (7.17), which is a significant value at the level of (1%), and the explanatory power of the regression model was (0.05), meaning total quality management explains (5%) of the changes that occur in loyalty standard job for employees.

<sup>\*\*</sup> Significant at the level of (1%), as can be seen from the table above

**D** - In general, whenever one unit of attention is given to comprehensive quality management, this will enhance job loyalty among employees by (0.60), which is a significant effect at the level of (1%), because the value of (t) calculated for the regression coefficient reached ((6.49, While the value of (F), which measures the significance of the regression model, was (42.15), which is a significant value at the level of (1%). The explanatory power of the regression model was (0.22), which means that total quality management explains (22%) of the changes that occur in employees' job loyalty. From the advanced analysis, the researchers infer the rejection of the fifth main hypothesis, meaning (there is a morally significant effect of total quality management In the job loyalty of employees in its dimensions, the researchers used the program (AMOS V.24) for the purpose of testing indirect and total effects, as well as verifying the fourth condition of the method (Baron & Kenny, 1986), as can be seen from Table (9) below. **Table: (9) Non-standard effects** 

Regression Weights: (Group number 1 - Default model)

		Estimate S.E.	C.R.	P		
Total Quality Management	<	Strategic Planning	.813	.088	9.249	***
Employee loyalty	<	Total Quality Management	.169	.082	1.971	.050
Employee loyalty	<	Strategic Planning	.960	.134	7.130	***

Source: Prepared by the researchers based on administrative literature.

It is clear from Table (9) that the value of the influence factor of the independent variable (strategic planning) on the dependent variable (job loyalty of employees) in the presence of the mediating variable (total quality management) amounted to (0.960), which is less than the value of the influence factor of the independent variable on the dependent variable without the presence The median was (1.11) as tested in the fifth hypothesis, that is, it is closer to zero, and the relationship was significant, from which the researchers infer that comprehensive quality management mediates (partially) the relationship between strategic planning and employees' job loyalty.

Accordingly, the researchers conclude by rejecting the sixth main hypothesis, meaning: (Total quality management mediates the relationship between strategic planning and employees' job loyalty).

**4- Testing the hypothesis of variation between the study variables:** It turns out that the seventh main hypothesis: (The directorate and the study community do not differ in the adoption of the study variables). The researchers used one-way analysis of variance in order to test the seventh main hypothesis, as in Table (10).

Table: (10) Test of variance of study variables

ANOVA									
Study variables									
	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.				
Between Groups	14.328	2	7.164	29.244	.000				
Within Groups	108.032	441	.245						
Total	122.360	443							

Source: Prepared by the researchers based on administrative literature.

It is clear from Table (10) above that the value of the (F) test reached (29.244), which is a significant value at the level of (1%), through which the researchers infer the rejection of the seventh main hypothesis, meaning: (The directorate and the study population differ in their adoption of the study variables).

#### Conclusions

The researchers present what are the most important results reached by this study and the recommendations that were able to be drawn in light of these results, in addition to adding proposed future studies.

The strength of awareness of the employees in the Directorate of Training and Qualification and the study community of the importance of strategic planning, which means the availability of a moderate level of strategic culture.

The strength of the directorate's ability to transform its vision into a tangible reality, and these results mean its need to take realistic steps for the purpose of clarifying its vision to its employees.

The directorate, in the study community, relies on dialogue with employees before making decisions regarding them, which indicates its reliance on dialogue with employees before making a decision regarding them, and this is a good indicator, in addition to its need to adopt a specific methodology to make strategic decisions that improve its performance.

The results showed that the Directorate needs to focus on improving the level of its organizational climate in a way that supports comprehensive quality applications. This indicates that the Directorate is always constantly reviewing the quality of its services, and the goal is to achieve trainees' satisfaction.

These results mean the need for senior management in the directorate, the study community, to consider the comprehensive quality approach as a daily work approach that cannot be neglected. This indicates that the directorate gives the relevant departments the authority to make decisions that concern their work.

The results demonstrated the need for senior management in the directorate, the study population, to enhance the integration and training of employees regarding the implementation of the total quality program. This indicates that the directorate trains its employees on comprehensive quality practices.

### Recommendations

The necessity of working to involve the employees of the Training and Qualification Directorate with the study community and inform them of the strategic plans drawn up and train them to implement them due to the nature of the Directorate's security work.

Working to clarify the vision of the directorate to the educational community, including officers, employees and ranks, so that they have an idea of the place in which they work.

Coordinating with universities and training and development centers in order to include the Directorate's employees in courses related to strategic planning, since the Directorate is the study community and takes it upon itself to complete the annual training plan for the Ministry of Interior.

Working to provide the appropriate internal organizational environment for the purpose of implementing the requirements of the subject of comprehensive quality management in the Directorate of Training and Qualification, the study community, and because it helps in working to develop the Directorate and make it one of the necessary service departments in the Ministry of Interior because it contributes to introducing the Ministry's employees into special training centers for courses and studies. And promotions.

The belief on the part of those in charge of the directorate and the study community that achieving and consolidating the principles of comprehensive quality management is the responsibility of all its employees, including officers, ranks, and employees, and is not limited to the quality departments and divisions in the directorate and the ministry only. One of the most important factors for success and the success of the directorates and their ministries is working to provide equal opportunities in order to work to enhance the skills and experiences required for the purpose of successfully implementing comprehensive quality management, and this must apply to the directorate and the study community, as the success of the directorate is the success of the Ministry of Interior as a whole.

#### **REFERENCES**

Al-Attar, F. H & Shaltagh, S. G, 2020, Role of Strategic planning in Enhancing Quality of Organizational Performance, published master's thesis, College of Administration and Economics. University of Karbala, Iraq.

- Role of Strategic Planning in Enhancing Employees' Job Loyalty through Comprehensive Quality Management
- Al-Barzanji, H. Sh., 2022, Interaction of Human Engineering Applications with Requirements of comprehensive Quality Management and their impact on value engineering, Published Doctoral Thesis, College of Administration and Economics. University of Baghdad, Iraq.
- Al-Kalabi, N. & Khader, H. A. Z., 2021, Effect of Organizational Loyalty on Improving Job Performance," Warith Al-Anbiya University Journal, Karbala, Volume )4(, Issue) 9(, Iraq.
- Al-Mousawi, M. M. & Abboud, A. H, 2020, Effect of inspirational leadership on Organizational Loyalty, published research, Journal of Management and Economics, Volume )9(, Issue )35(, Iraq.
- Al-Saffar, N. A. & Obeidat, A. M. 2020 .The effect of total quality management practices on employee performance: The moderating role of knowledge sharing. Contents lists available at Growing Science Management Science Letters homepage.
- Al-Salem, M. A, 2015, Organizational loyalty among General Secondary Education Teachers and its relationship to participation in decision-making, unpublished master's thesis, Faculty of Education, Damascus University, Syria.
- Arifin, S,& Darmawan, D,& Hartanto, C. F, & Rahman, A. 2022. Human Resources based on Total Quality Management. Journal of Social Science Studies (JOS3), 2 (1), )17-20.(
- Bin Ahmed, M.&. Latrash, S. 2017, The role of strategic planning in achieving competitive advantage in the organization, published master's thesis, Faculty of Economic Sciences, Larbi Ben M'hidi University. Algeria.
- David ,F. R., 2016, Strategic Management ,12th^ed ,Prentic Hall , Inc .
- Esmaeili , M. R , 2014 , A study on the effect of the strategic intelligence on decision making and strategic planning , International Journal of Asian Social Science ,Vol.)4(,No.)10(.
- Hair, J.F.& Anderson, R.E. 2010. Multivariate Data Analysis. 7th Edition, Pearson, New York .
- Hajji, H. H, 2022, Implementing Comprehensive Quality Management in Iraqi libraries the central library at the University of Dohuk as a model, published research, Journal of the College of Education Wasit University, Volume )48(, Issue )1(, Iraq.
- Heizer, G, & Render, B. & Munson, C. 2017. Operation Management: Sustainability and Supply Chain Management. 12th ed. Upper Sadale River.
- Kazem, Z. K & F, I. H, 2020, Role of Human Resources Development in Achieving Organizational loyalty, published research, Al-Reyadah Journal of Finance and Business, Volume )1(, Issue )1(, Iraq.
- Khaled, M, & Al-Ani, L. M, 2018, Reality of strategic planning in Jordanian universities: Comparative study between public and private universities, Al-Manara Magazine, Volume )24(, Issue) 3(, Jordan.
- Lynch, R, 2015, Strategic management , 7 Edition, published by pearson Education Limited.
- Muhammad, O. M. & Mahmoud, S. F. 2019, Role of Organizational Loyalty in Reducing work Turnover, published research, Anbar University Journal of Economic and Administrative Sciences, Volume )11(, Issue )24(, Iraq.
- Owais, B. E, 2019, Level of Organizational Loyalty of School Principals and its relationship to their outstanding performance, published research, Journal of the College of Basic Education for Educational and Human Sciences, University of Babylon, Issue) 45(, Iraq.
- Qawasmeh ,F. M , & Darqa ,N & Qawasmeh ,I. F , 2013 , The Role of Organization Culture in Achieving Organizational Excellence, Jadara University as a Case Study , International Journal of Economics & Management Sciences ,Vol. 2(,No) )7(.
- Radwan, A. G. 2016, Impact of organizational loyalty on employee performance, an applied study on some Egyptian organizations, published master's thesis, Faculty of Commerce, Egyptian Arab Republic.
- Sadiq, Z. M & Najm, F. H & Ahmed, S. A, 2016, Role of Organizational Culture Types in organizational loyalty, an exploratory study of the opinions of a sample of administrative leaders at the Administrative Technical Institute in the city of Erbil, published research, Anbar University Journal of Science Economic and Administrative, Anbar University, Volume) 8(, Issue No.)61(, Iraq.
- Saleh, Sh. A. & Abdullah, A. M, 2021, Effect of Connected Leader Behavior in Enhancing Employee Organizational loyalty, published research, Tikrit Journal of Administrative and Economic Sciences, College of Administration and Economics, Tikrit University, Volume )17(, No.)55(, Iraq.
- Souissi, A, 2018, Impact of Organizational Culture on Organizational Loyalty of Employees in the organization, doctoral thesis, Faculty of Social and Human Sciences, Zian Ashour University of Djelfa, Algeria.
- Stevenson, W. J. 2018. Operations Management. 13th ed, Rochester Institute of Technology, Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data. New York USA.
- Ursachi, G ,& Ioana. A, & Adriana Z. 2015 .How reliable are measurement scales? External factors with indirect influence on reliability estimators. Procedia Economics and Finance 20.