Smart Governance in Public Services at the One-Stop Investment and Integrated Service Office of Palopo City

Syamsuriadi Nur¹, Gita Susanti², Amril Hans³

Abstract

This study examines the implementation of smart governance in the public services of the DPMPTSP Office in Palopo City, focusing on six key indicators: Smart Use of ICT, Smart Collaboration and Participation, Smart Internal Coordination, Smart Decision-Making, Smart Administration, and Smart Outcomes. Through qualitative research involving interviews and document analysis, reveal significant advancements, such as the adoption of digital applications and electronic signatures to enhance service delivery and data security. Successful collaboration through the establishment of the Public Service Mall (MPP) and improved internal coordination highlight the city's commitment to integrated services. However, challenges remain, including technical issues, limited public digital literacy, and the need for systematic efforts to attract investment and foster social inclusion. The study underscores the necessity of continued infrastructure improvements, enhanced public engagement, and strategic initiatives to achieve sustainable economic growth and comprehensive smart outcomes.

Keywords: Public Services, Smart City, Smart Governance, Technology

INTRODUCTION

Public service is a fundamental pillar of any nation, designed to meet the needs of its citizens as enshrined in its Constitution. The efficiency and effectiveness of public services are key indicators of a government's commitment to upholding citizens' basic rights, ensuring justice, certainty, and welfare for all. In the context of good governance, integrating information technology is crucial for enhancing public service effectiveness. The shift towards a "smart" government system is essential to meet the growing demand for faster, more efficient, and transparent services. This shift aligns with the Smart City concept, a forward-looking initiative aimed at improving quality of life and optimizing public service delivery through digital technology.

Over the last two decades, the concept of smart cities has gained considerable traction among researchers and policymakers. Smart cities utilize information and communication technologies (ICTs) to provide innovative services to citizens, enhancing their quality of life and promoting sustainable economic growth (Yigitcanlar et al., 2018). Within this context, Smart Governance stands out as a critical component, focusing on responsive, transparent, and citizen-centric governance. Batagan (2011) explains that smart governance involves fostering collaboration across departments and communities, promoting economic growth, and ensuring that services are centered around citizens' needs. The increasing influence of technology in urban systems necessitates a reevaluation of governmental roles in a knowledge-driven society. This evolving role is encapsulated in the concept of 'Smart Governance' as explored in prior studies (Giffinger et al., 2007). According to Townsend (2013), smart cities utilize extensive digital technologies to make urban systems more responsive to residents' needs, embodying the essence of Smart Governance.

In Palopo City, the implementation of Smart Governance is guided by Palopo Mayor Regulation Number 26 of 2020, which establishes the framework for the Electronic Based Government System (SPBE). The city's development initiatives are heavily influenced by the Smart City concept, emphasizing innovation and sustainability. The Palopo City One-Stop Investment and Integrated Service Office (DPMPTSP) has adopted Smart Governance principles to streamline bureaucratic processes, enhance community-government interaction, and improve public service accessibility. Schaffers et al. (2011) argue that a smart city leverages human and social capital, along with modern telecommunications, to drive economic growth and improve life quality through participatory governance.

¹ Department of Public Administration, Hasanuddin University, Indonesia, Email: <u>syamsuriadi9@gmail.com</u>

² Department of Public Administration, Hasanuddin University, Indonesia, Email: gitasusanti65@gmail.com

³ Department of Public Administration, Hasanuddin University, Indonesia, Email: <u>amrilhans@gmail.com</u>

However, the implementation of Smart Governance at DPMPTSP Palopo City faces several challenges. These include the digital divide and resistance to change among both government personnel and the public. This research aims to explore the implementation of Smart Governance in public services at DPMPTSP Palopo City, using the evaluative framework proposed by Bolívar & Meijer (2016). By examining six key indicators—Smart Use of ICT, Smart Collaboration and Participation, Smart Internal Coordination, Smart Decision-Making, Smart Administration, and Smart Outcomes—this study seeks to provide a comprehensive understanding of the current state and potential improvements in Palopo City's smart governance practices.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Smart City

The term 'smart city' refers to the intelligent use and leverage of information and communication technology (ICT) to make an urban environment more attractive, livable, sustainable and competitive, besides other dimensions indicating urban smartness (Chourabi et al., 2012). Cohen (2012) further defined Smart City by weighting environmental aspects to be: Smart City uses ICT intelligently and efficiently uses a variety of resources, resulting in cost and energy savings, improving services and quality of life, and reducing environmental footprint - all supporting innovation and the economy, environmentally friendly. The interconnected phenomena of the smart city (as an urban environment) and smart city government have been studied from various standpoints such as economy, governance, education, mobility, quality of life and environment (Caragliu et al., 2009; Giffinger & Gudrun, 2010; Hollands, 2008; Nam & Pardo, 2011). Scholl & AlAwadhi (2015) provided a programmatic definition of the term 'smart city' as the utilization of advanced information and communication technologies by local governments to create, integrate, combine, develop, and leverage resources and assets towards fostering innovation, attractiveness, competitiveness, sustainability, and livability within urban spaces.

Smart Governance

Smart Governances is generally defined as the ability to use digital technology and intelligent actions to process information and make decisions (Scholl & Alawadhi, 2016; Pereira et al., 2018). According to Giffinger & Gudrun (2010) Smart Governance is one dimension of Smart Cities, which embraces all the aspects related with political participation and services for citizens, as well as the functioning of the local administration. He defines a Smart City as a city that performs well in these six dimensions: smart economy, smart people, smart governance, smart mobility, smart environment, and smart living. A common aspect of implementing smart governance is the increasing use of social media, smartphones, portals, crowdsourcing platforms, and planning support systems that generally promote wise government and services, electronic participation, and broader collaboration through a top down and bottom-up approach. This lead to gradual changes in the organization of government, new relationships between government, the private sector, and citizens, and improvements in cities (Lin, 2018).

Gil-Garcia et al. (2015) provide a characterization of smart governance based on three main building blocks: stakeholder engagement, ICT-based provision of services, and network-based relationships such as collaborations or partnerships. However, smart governance is a complex and multifaceted topic, and literature has extensively discussed various components, outcomes, measurements, and contextual factors. Bolivar and Meijer (2016) use six elements to define a smart governance. These six elements can also be categorized into three groups: (1) the use of a technology (smart ICT); (2) organizational processes (smart collaboration and participation, smart internal administration, smart decision making, and smart administration); and (3) aspired outcomes (smart outcomes).

METHOD

This research adopts a qualitative research methodology using a descriptive approach. Moleong (2008) describes qualitative research as an approach aimed at comprehending phenomena through the experiences of research subjects, such as their behaviours, perceptions, motivations, and actions. This research was conducted at the one-stop integrated services of Palopo, South Sulawesi. The primary data is obtained from in-depth interviews with several key informants, namely Head of the one-stop integrated services of Palopo, Head of the one-stop integrated services of Palopo, Head of and public complaints, and integrated services of the agency, Head of service license assessment and processing, and public

Smart Governance in Public Services at the One-Stop Investment and Integrated Service Office of Palopo City

service recipients namely the citizen of Palopo. While secondary data is obtained through document reports from the one-stop integrated services of Palopo. This study uses an interactive model from (Miles & Huberman, 2014) as a data analysis technique, The data analysis process is carried out through 4 stages namely Data Condensation, Data Display, and Drawing Conclusion

DISCUSSION

Smart Use of ICTs

The smart use of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) refers to the strategic and innovative application of digital tools and technologies to enhance governance practices, service delivery, and citizen engagement within Smart cities. It involves leveraging ICTs to improve communication, data management, decision-making processes, and public service delivery, ultimately leading to more efficient and effective urban governance.

Services at DPMPTSP have maximized the use of ICTs in every process. This can be seen through the availability of digital platforms in each type of service. Not only that, each file has also been authorized through an electronic signature. To maximize services, the office has also installed a wifi network with sufficient MBPS capacity, it's just that service constraints are in the availability of computers that have not been met. Ideally, each employee is equipped with one computer, but in reality one computer is operated by more than 1 employee.

Based on research findings related to the intelligent utilization of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) at the DPMPTSP Kota Palopo, it is evident that the office has made significant strides in leveraging digital technology to improve the quality of public services. The integration of various applications into the service process is a key highlight. For example, the implementation of electronic signatures on important documents has not only streamlined workflows but also enhanced the trust and security in data management, showcasing DPMPTSP Kota Palopo's capability in maintaining document integrity and validity through advanced technology. Moreover, the installation of high-speed Wi-Fi networks with sufficient Mbps capacity for both employees and the public demonstrates a strong commitment to increasing accessibility and efficiency. This ensures that both staff and service users can seamlessly access online services and resources, thereby reducing wait times and improving overall service delivery.

Despite these advancements, there are areas that still require improvement. To achieve maximum efficiency, it is essential to further upgrade infrastructure and supporting facilities. Enhancements such as robust data management systems, more comprehensive digital platforms for service delivery, and continuous training for staff on new technologies will help in realizing the full potential of ICT in public service delivery. By addressing these areas, DPMPTSP Kota Palopo can ensure that the application of ICT is not only effective but also sustainable, ultimately providing optimal benefits for both employees and the community they serve.

Smart Collaboration and Participation

Smart governance consequently requires the cooperation of different levels of government as well as business and non-government organizations, information sharing, and stakeholder involvement in the decision-making process (Alawadhi et al., 2012; Chourabi et al., 2012; Johnston & Hansen, 2015). Bolivar and Meijer (2016) use smart collaboration and participation in smart governance. Smart collaboration and participation refer to the ability of a government to work effectively with external stakeholders, such as communities, businesses, and non-governmental organizations, in both decision-making processes and the delivery of public services. This approach involves engaging citizens in governance, seeking their input, and involving them in co-creating solutions to societal challenges. According to Batty et al. (2012), smart governance includes a robust intelligence function for coordinating the various components that comprise a smart city. Batagan (2011) further defines smart governance as fostering collaboration between various departments and community stakeholders, which stimulates economic development and emphasizes a crucial shift towards operations and services genuinely centered around the needs of citizens.

Based on the research findings, the implementation of smart collaboration and participation at DPMPTSP Kota Palopo has shown significant success through the establishment of the Public Service Mall (Mal Pelayanan Publik - MPP) since 2019, making it a pioneer in Eastern Indonesia. This initiative underscores a strong commitment to consolidating various services from multiple agencies into one location, thereby streamlining processes and enhancing service delivery. The success of this collaboration is further reinforced by commitment meetings that involve technical departments related to the licensing process, ensuring transparency and accountability at every step.

However, the research also identifies areas for further improvement, particularly in expanding cooperation and participation with investors from both within and outside the region. Increasing promotional activities to attract more investors is crucial. Additionally, enhancing collaboration with the banking sector is essential to provide more financing options and financial services for the community and investors. This approach supports economic growth and promotes more inclusive development in Kota Palopo. These efforts demonstrate the importance of collaborative strategies in public service delivery. By continuously fostering partnerships and engaging various stakeholders, DPMPTSP Kota Palopo can further enhance its service offerings, making processes more efficient and accessible to the public while supporting broader economic and social development goals.

Smart Internal Collaboration

Smart internal coordination refers to the ability of a government to effectively coordinate and integrate activities, resources, and information across different departments and units within the organization. This coordination is essential for ensuring that all parts of the government work together towards common goals and objectives, leading to improved efficiency, effectiveness, and overall performance. Internal coordination involves establishing clear communication channels, defining roles and responsibilities, sharing information and resources, and aligning processes and workflows to avoid duplication of efforts and promote synergy among departments. It also includes fostering a collaborative and cooperative work culture where employees are encouraged to work together, share knowledge, and support each other in achieving organizational goals. Effective internal coordination can lead to streamlined decision-making processes, faster response times to emerging issues, better allocation of resources, and enhanced service delivery to citizens. It can also help in identifying and addressing gaps or inefficiencies within the organization, leading to continuous improvement and innovation. In the context of smart governance, smart internal coordination is crucial for ensuring that government agencies can adapt to the rapidly changing environment, leverage technology and data effectively, and collaborate seamlessly to address complex challenges faced by modern societies.

The implementation of smart internal collaboration at DPMPTSP Kota Palopo has been pivotal in enhancing organizational efficiency and service delivery. The research findings highlight that internal coordination among various departments within DPMPTSP has led to a more integrated and streamlined workflow. This internal collaboration ensures that all departments are aligned and work cohesively towards common goals, thereby reducing redundancy and improving overall operational efficiency. Key to this success has been the establishment of clear communication channels and regular coordination meetings among departments. These meetings facilitate the sharing of information and resources, ensuring that every department is aware of ongoing projects and can contribute effectively. Additionally, the use of integrated information systems has enabled real-time data sharing and decision-making, further enhancing the agility and responsiveness of the organization.

However, the research also identifies areas for improvement. There is a need for continuous training and development programs to ensure that all staff are proficient in using the integrated systems and are aware of the latest technological advancements. Moreover, fostering a culture of collaboration and teamwork is essential for sustaining the gains achieved through smart internal collaboration. In summary, while DPMPTSP Kota Palopo has made significant strides in smart internal collaboration, ongoing efforts to enhance communication, training, and a collaborative culture are crucial for maintaining and building on these achievements. These efforts will ensure that the organization remains efficient and responsive to the needs of the public, ultimately contributing to better service delivery and organizational performance

Smart Decision-Making

Smart decision-making in the context of smart governance represents a strategic approach that leverages data, technology, and collaboration to make informed and effective decisions. This process transcends traditional decision-making methods by integrating innovative strategies and digital tools to analyze information, consider multiple perspectives, and select the most optimal actions to achieve desired outcomes. Such an approach is critical in modern urban environments where rapid changes and interconnected systems demand agile and data-driven decision-making processes.

The DPMPTSP Office in Palopo exemplifies smart decision-making by utilizing available data to analyze and determine the best possible outcomes in their decision-making process. The data collected from their respective service websites are utilized to enhance service quality continually. For example, service usage statistics and user feedback from these websites provide insights into which services are most in demand and where there might be bottlenecks or inefficiencies. By monitoring these metrics, the DPMPTSP can adjust resource allocation, streamline processes, and introduce new features or services to better meet citizen needs. Additionally, data on staffing is used to make decisions regarding employee performance. For instance, attendance records are analyzed to identify patterns of tardiness or absenteeism, allowing management to issue warnings or take corrective actions to improve punctuality and overall productivity. This use of data ensures that personnel management is fair and based on objective criteria, promoting a more disciplined and efficient workforce. Feedback and suggestions from the public, gathered through suggestion boxes located in the office and the DPMPTSP website, also play a crucial role in the decision-making process. This direct input from citizens helps the office understand community needs and preferences, leading to more citizen-centric service improvements. By incorporating public feedback into their decision-making process, the DPMPTSP ensures that its services remain relevant and effective.

Decisions at the DPMPTSP Office are made through collaborative discussions during meetings that involve the relevant divisions and are ultimately approved by the head of the office. This collaborative approach ensures that decisions are well-rounded and consider various aspects of the organization and community needs. For example, when planning new initiatives or policies, input is solicited from different departments to ensure that all perspectives are considered, and potential impacts are thoroughly evaluated. This inclusive process helps build consensus and fosters a sense of ownership and accountability among staff. By incorporating technology and data analytics into their decision-making process, the DPMPTSP Office aims to enhance the efficiency, transparency, and effectiveness of its operations. This methodology allows policymakers and administrators to respond swiftly to challenges, anticipate future trends, and align decisions with broader goals of sustainable development, citizen well-being, and economic growth. For instance, predictive analytics might be used to forecast future service demands based on current usage trends, enabling the DPMPTSP to proactively allocate resources and plan for future needs.

The implementation of smart decision-making at the DPMPTSP Office fosters a culture of evidence-based governance. Decisions grounded in data-driven insights and stakeholder engagement lead to more impactful and successful outcomes in urban governance. This strategic process not only improves internal operations but also contributes to the development of a more agile and responsive government capable of adapting to the evolving needs of citizens and the complexities of modern urban governance. Through this approach, the DPMPTSP can better navigate the challenges of urban management and deliver high-quality services that enhance the quality of life for Palopo City's residents.

Smart Administration

Smart administration in the context of Smart governance refers to the efficient and effective management of government operations through the strategic use of technology and digital tools. It involves leveraging Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) to streamline administrative processes, enhance service delivery, and improve overall governance practices. Smart administration encompasses various aspects such as e-administration, which focuses on the online interaction of government agencies with the public to deliver services and fulfil mandates. By embracing smart administration practices, governments can enhance

transparency, responsiveness, and citizen engagement, ultimately leading to more efficient and citizen-centric services. Moreover, smart administration plays a crucial role in promoting innovation and modernization within government agencies. By adopting digital solutions and automation, administrative tasks can be optimized, reducing bureaucratic inefficiencies and enhancing the overall performance of public services. This shift towards smart administration not only improves internal processes but also contributes to the development of a more agile and responsive government that can adapt to the evolving needs of citizens and the challenges of urban governance. Not only prioritizing technology-based public services, Mason (2017) explains that the public has certain rights in public services, namely by prioritizing the principles of Privacy, Accuracy, Property, and Accesibility.

The implementation of smart administration in the DPMPTSP Office of Palopo has been marked by significant technological advancements aimed at improving service delivery and operational efficiency. Based on the regulation of the mayor of Palopo City number 31 of 2023, DPMPTSP provides a variety of services including People Transportation Route Permits, Permits for Early Childhood Education, Health Worker Licenses, and Telecommunication Tower Operational Permits, among others. The integration of information and communication technology (ICT) into these services has streamlined workflows, reduced bureaucratic delays, and enhanced the overall efficiency of public service provision.

According to research findings, the adoption of technology such as the Online Single Submission (OSS), SiCANTIK, and the Building Management Information System (SIMBG) has significantly advanced smart administration in the DPMPTSP of Palopo City. These systems have facilitated public access to licensing and administrative services online, improving efficiency and reducing bureaucracy. However, despite these significant efforts, there are still some technical issues like network disruptions and website errors that hinder public access and often force people to visit the office for assistance. Furthermore, there are challenges related to public awareness and understanding of using technology and administrative requirements. Some segments of the population, especially the elderly, struggle with digital platforms and often require direct assistance. This indicates a need for further efforts in education and socialization regarding the use of technology.

To address these challenges and further enhance smart administration, several recommendations are proposed. Investing in robust and reliable IT infrastructure is crucial to minimize network disruptions and ensure continuous accessibility of online services. Conducting regular training sessions for both employees and the public can improve digital literacy and familiarity with the available online services. Providing comprehensive online access to all service-related functionalities, including the ability for the public to print permits and documents without needing to visit the office, is essential. Establishing a centralized data bank accessible to all employees can improve data storage, convenience, security, and capacity. Additionally, implementing awareness campaigns to educate the community about the benefits and usage of technologybased services will ensure inclusivity for all age groups.

Smart Outcomes

Smart outcomes in smart city governance refer to the desired results from intelligent governance practices. According to Boli'var and Meijer (2016), these outcomes are categorized into three levels. The first level focuses on internal organizational efficiency through technology, improving processes and reducing costs. The second level aims to enhance government-citizen relationships, providing citizen-centric services, increasing satisfaction and engagement, and boosting city appeal through smart branding. The third level targets overall city improvement, including economic growth, social inclusion, ecological performance, and educational enhancement, creating a business-friendly environment, ensuring equal service access, promoting sustainability, and fostering innovation.

The implementation of smart outcomes at the DPMPTSP Kota Palopo has shown significant progress across different levels, but challenges remain in reaching the highest level of smart governance. The first level, focusing on internal organizational changes, has seen substantial improvements through the adoption of various technologies such as the Online Single Submission (OSS), SiCANTIK, and the Building Management Information System (SIMBG). These systems have streamlined the process of accessing licensing and administrative services online, thereby increasing efficiency and reducing bureaucracy. For instance, services

Smart Governance in Public Services at the One-Stop Investment and Integrated Service Office of Palopo City

like Building Approval Permits (PBG), Route Permits, and Pharmacy Permits can be accessed directly through the official DPMPTSP website, while risk-based business licensing and non-business services are available via cloud-based platforms like SiCANTIK. This technological integration has not only facilitated quicker decisionmaking and administrative processes but also reduced operational costs, as evidenced by user feedback that highlights the convenience and speed of obtaining permits.

In terms of the second level, which involves enhancing the relationship between the government and citizens, DPMPTSP Kota Palopo has also made notable strides. The implementation of the Public Service Mall (MPP) in 2019 exemplifies this progress by providing a one-stop service center that integrates multiple services from various agencies. This initiative has improved citizen satisfaction by making it easier to handle various permits in one place, thus eliminating the need to visit multiple offices. Moreover, regular commitment meetings with technical agencies involved in the permitting process ensure transparency and accountability. However, there are still areas for improvement, such as expanding collaboration with investors and the banking sector to provide more financial options and support for economic growth and development.

Despite these advancements, achieving the third level of smart outcomes remains a challenge. This level is characterized by broader impacts such as economic growth, social inclusion, and enhanced educational outcomes. The fluctuating economic conditions in Kota Palopo, as reflected in the varying growth rates reported by the Central Bureau of Statistics, indicate that the efforts to attract investment and foster economic stability are still insufficient. While initiatives like investment profile reports and focus group discussions on investment potential are positive steps, they have not yet translated into sustained economic growth. Additionally, there is a need for more systematic approaches to enhance social inclusion and educational opportunities.

In conclusion, while DPMPTSP Kota Palopo has made significant progress in implementing smart outcomes, particularly in improving internal efficiency and citizen-centric services, further efforts are needed to achieve sustainable economic growth and comprehensive social inclusion. This includes continuing to foster a business-friendly environment, strengthening social inclusion initiatives, and promoting higher education to align with the broader goals of smart governance.

CONCLUSION

The study on smart governance in the public services of the DPMPTSP Office in Palopo City reveals significant advancements and ongoing challenges across six key indicators: Smart Use of ICT, Smart Collaboration and Participation, Smart Internal Coordination, Smart Decision-Making, Smart Administration, and Smart Outcomes. The implementation of ICT has greatly improved service delivery through digital applications and electronic signatures, enhancing trust and data security, although further infrastructure improvements are necessary for maximum efficiency. The establishment of the Public Service Mall (MPP) demonstrates successful collaboration and integration of services, yet expanding partnerships with investors and financial institutions is crucial for economic growth. Internal coordination has been strengthened through regular commitment meetings involving technical OPDs, but more systematic efforts are needed for comprehensive collaboration. Decision-making processes have been enhanced through data utilization, yet expanding digital access for public feedback remains a priority. Smart administration has seen progress with the adoption of systems like OSS and SiCANTIK, although technical challenges and public digital literacy need addressing. Finally, while initial smart outcomes indicate improved efficiency and citizen-centric services, achieving sustainable economic growth, social inclusion, and enhanced educational opportunities remains a challenge requiring ongoing effort and strategic initiative.

REFERENCES

Bătăgan, L. (2011). Smart cities and sustainability models. Informatica Economică, 15(3), 80-87.

Batty, M., Axhausen, K. W., Giannotti, F., Pozdnoukhov, A., Bazzani, A., Wachowicz, M., ... & Portugali, Y. (2012). Smart cities of the future. The European Physical Journal Special Topics, 214, 481-518.

Bolívar, M. P. R., & Meijer, A. J. (2016). Smart governance: Using a literature rview and empirical analysis to build a research model. Social Science Computer Review, 34(6), 673-692.

- Caragliu, A., Del Bo, C., & Nijkamp.: P. (2009). Smart cities in Europe. In Proceedings of the 3rd Central European Conference in Regional Science. Košice, Slovak Republic (pp. 7-9).
- Chourabi, H., Nam, T., Walker, S., Gil-Garcia, J. R., Mellouli, S., Nahon, K., ... & Scholl, H. J. (2012, January). Understanding smart cities: An integrative framework. In 2012 45th Hawaii international conference on system sciences (pp. 2289-2297). IEEE.

Cohen, B. (2012). What exactly is a smart city. Co. Exist, 19.

- Giffinger, R., & Gudrun, H. (2010). Smart cities ranking: an effective instrument for the positioning of the cities?. ACE: architecture, city and environment, 4(12), 7-26.
- Giffinger, R., Fertner, C., Kramar, H., & Meijers, E. (2007). City-ranking of European medium-sized cities. Cent. Reg. Sci. Vienna UT, 9(1), 1-12.
- Lin, Y. (2018). A comparison of selected Western and Chinese smart governance: The application of ICT in governmental management, participation and collaboration. Telecommunications policy, 42(10), 800-809.
- Mason, R. O. (2017). Four ethical issues of the information age. In Computer ethics (pp. 41-48). Routledge.
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook. Sage.
- Moleong, L. (2008). Qualitative Research Methodology. Bandung: PT Juvenile Rosdakarya.
- Schaffers, H., Komninos, N., Pallot, M., Trousse, B., Nilsson, M., & Oliveira, A. (2011). Smart cities and the future internet: Towards cooperation frameworks for open innovation (pp. 431-446). Springer Berlin Heidelberg.
- Scholl HJ, AlAwadhi S. (2015). Creating Smart Governance: The Key to Radical ICT Overhaul at the City of Munich, Information Polity, 20(3): 1–22
- Scholl, H. J., & AlAwadhi, S. (2016). Smart governance as key to multi-jurisdictional smart city initiatives: The case of the eCityGov Alliance. Social Science Information, 55(2), 255-277.
- Townsend, A. M. (2013). Smart cities: Big data, civic hackers, and the quest for a new utopia. WW Norton & Company.
- Gil-Garcia, J. R., Pardo, T. A., & Nam, T. (2015). What makes a city smart? Identifying core components and proposing an integrative and comprehensive conceptualization. *Information Polity*, 20(1), 61-87.
- Yigitcanlar, T., & Lee, S. H. (2014). Korean ubiquitous-eco-city: A smart-sustainable urban form or a branding hoax?. Technological Forecasting and Social Change, 89, 100-114.
- Alawadhi, S., Aldama-Nalda, A., Chourabi, H., Gil-Garcia, J. R., Leung, S., Mellouli, S., ... & Walker, S. (2012). Building understanding of smart city initiatives. In *Electronic Government: 11th IFIP WG 8.5 International Conference, EGOV 2012, Kristiansand, Norway, September 3-6, 2012. Proceedings 11* (pp. 40-53). Springer Berlin Heidelberg.
- Chourabi, H., Nam, T., Walker, S., Gil-Garcia, J. R., Mellouli, S., Nahon, K., ... & Scholl, H. J. (2012, January). Understanding smart cities: An integrative framework. In 2012 45th Hawaii international conference on system sciences (pp. 2289-2297). IEEE.

Johnston, E. W., & Hansen, D. L. (2015). Design lessons for smart governance infrastructure. In *Transforming American governance: Rebooting the public square* (pp. 197-212). Routledge.